

# ULSTER COUNTY LEGISLATURE

DAVID B. DONALDSON, Chairman  
TRACEY A. BARTELS, Vice Chairwoman  
JONATHAN R. HEPPNER, Majority Leader  
KENNETH J. RONK, JR., Minority Leader  
VICTORIA A. FABELLA, Clerk



P.O. Box 1800  
KINGSTON, NEW YORK 12402  
Telephone: 845 340-3900  
FAX: 845 340-3651

## MINUTES

**JULY 14, 2020**

## PUBLIC HEARINGS

**6:15 PM**

**Powered by Zoom. Meeting ID: 982 3131 7216  
And By Telephone (646) 558-8656**

**PUBIC HEARING CALLED TO ORDER BY CHAIR: 6:15 PM**

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG AND MOMENT OF SILENT MEDITATION:**  
Led by Legislator Albert Bruno.

**ROLL CALL:** Present: 19 Absent: 4 (Legislators Archer, Fabiano, Roberts, & Uchitelle)

Note: Legislators Roberts and Uchitelle arrived at 6:25 PM

### Public in Attendance:

Jamie Capuano, VP Admin. Services SUNY UCCC  
Andrew Chafatelli, Rocking Horse Ranch  
Evelyn Clark, Town Council, Town of Esopus  
Alex Dean, Community Outreach Coordinator, Town of Esopus  
Mark Dorr, NYS Hospitality & Tourism Association  
Patricia Doxsey, Daily Freeman  
March Gallagher, UC Comptroller  
Eric Gullickson, President Mohonk Mountain House  
Shannon Harris, Supervisor Town of Esopus / President UC Supervisors & Mayors Assoc.  
Mid-Hudson News Representative  
Tamara Murray, Emerson Resort & Spa / Ulster County Lodging Coalition

Kathy Nolan, Catskill Mountainkeeper  
Dr. Alan Roberts, President SUNY UCCC  
Thomas Smiley, CEO Mohonk Mountain House  
Barbara Stirewalt, General Manger Mohonk Mountain House  
Steve Turk, Rocking Horse Ranch  
Jen Zell, Acting Chief of Staff & Secretary to the Board of Trustees, SUNY UCCC

**6:15 PM - CALL OF THE 1<sup>st</sup> PUBLIC HEARING BY CLERK: 6:19 PM**

On Proposed Local Law No. 7 Of 2020, A Local Law Amending The Code Of The County Of Ulster In Relation To Local Law No. 5 Of 1991 (A Local Law Adopting A Hotel And Motel Room Occupancy Tax) To Clarify The Tax Law's Application To Short-Term And Vacation Rentals

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** There were six speakers signed up for public comment. (See transcript)

1. March Gallagher, UC Comptroller:
2. Thomas Smiley, Mohonk Mountain House:
3. Mark Dorr, NYS Hospitality & Tourism Association:
4. Kathy Nolan, Catskill Mountainkeeper:
5. Shannon Harris, Supervisor Town of Esopus/President UC Supervisors and Mayors Assoc.
6. Andrew Chafatelli, Rocking Horse Ranch:

Motion by Legislator Litts, second by Legislator Bruno to adjourn the public hearing. All in favor.

**PUBLIC HEARING ADJOURNED: 6:48 PM**

---

**6:20 PM - CALL OF THE 2<sup>nd</sup> PUBLIC HEARING BY CLERK: 6:48 PM**

On Proposed Local Law No. 4 Of 2020, A Local Law Establishing Certain Consumer Protection Practices In Ulster County And Penalties For Violating Same

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** There were no speakers signed up for public comment.

MINUTES  
PAGE 3  
JULY 14, 2020

Motion by Legislator Litts, second by Legislator Bruno to adjourn the public hearing. All in favor.

**PUBLIC HEARING ADJOURNED: 6:49 PM**

---

**6:30 PM - CALL OF THE 3<sup>rd</sup> PUBLIC HEARING BY CLERK: 6:49 PM**

On the Tentative Budget for Ulster County Community College for the Year 2020-2021

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** There were no speakers signed up for public comment.

Motion by Legislator Litts, second by Legislator Bruno to adjourn the public hearing. All in favor.

**PUBLIC HEARING ADJOURNED: 6:50 PM**

**NEXT MEETING:**

The next Regular Meeting of the Ulster County Legislature will be held next Tuesday, July 21, 2020 at 7:00 PM.

# ULSTER COUNTY LEGISLATURE

DAVID B. DONALDSON, Chairman  
TRACEY A. BARTELS, Vice Chairwoman  
JONATHAN R. HEPPNER, Majority Leader  
KENNETH J. RONK, JR., Minority Leader  
VICTORIA A. FABELLA, Clerk



P.O. Box 1800  
KINGSTON, NEW YORK 12402  
Telephone: 845 340-3900

## TRANSCRIPT

JULY 14, 2020

## PUBLIC HEARINGS

6:15 PM

Powered by Zoom. Meeting ID 982 3131 7216

And By Telephone (646) 558-8656

### **Chairman Donaldson**

All righty. Calling the Public Hearing to Order. I'd like to have Legislator Bruno please lead us in the Pledge to the Flag. And remain standing for a moment of silence. And the flag is up.

### **Chairman Donaldson**

You gotta unmute yourself Al.

### **Group members**

I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America, and to the Republic for which it stands, one Nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

### **Chairman Donaldson**

A moment of silence doesn't quite work very well.

### **Chairman Donaldson**

Roll call please Clerk Fabella.

### **Clerk Fabella**

Roll call. Archer.

### **Clerk Fabella**

Bartels.

### **Legislator Bartels**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Bruno.

**Legislator Bruno**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Cahill.

**Legislator Cahill**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Corcoran.

**Legislator Corcoran**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Criswell.

**Legislator Criswell**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Delaune. Delaune?

**Clerk Fabella**

Donaldson.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Fabiano.

**Clerk Fabella**

Gavaris.

**Legislator Gavaris**

Present.

**Clerk Fabella**

Greene.

**Legislator Greene**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Haynes.

**Legislator Haynes**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Heppner.

**Legislator Heppner**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Litts.

**Legislator Litts**

Hear.

**Clerk Fabella**

Lopez.

**Legislator Litts**

I see him.

**Clerk Fabella**

Maio.

**Legislator Maio**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**

Parete.

**Legislator Parete**

Yes.

**Clerk Fabella**

Petit.

**Legislator Petit**

Here.

**Clerk Fabella**  
Roberts.

**Clerk Fabella**  
Ronk.

**Legislator Ronk**  
Present.

**Clerk Fabella**  
Uchitelle

**Clerk Fabella**  
Walter.

**Legislator Walter**  
Here.

**Clerk Fabella**  
Wawro.

**Legislator Wawro**  
Here.

**Clerk Fabella**  
I'm going to go back to DeLaune because I see him.

**Legislator Delaune**  
Here.

**Clerk Fabella**  
Nineteen present and four absent.

**Clerk Fabella**  
Tonight's first Public Hearing is on: Proposed Local Law No. 7 Of 2020, A Local Law Amending The Code Of The County Of Ulster In Relation To Local Law No. 5 Of 1991 (A Local Law Adopting A Hotel And Motel Room Occupancy Tax) To Clarify The Tax Law's Application To Short-Term And Vacation Rentals.

**Clerk Fabella**  
We do already have some speakers signed up and I know there may be some more. So, I'm going to read the speakers we have, we will go in that order. And then Chairman Donaldson will ask if there's anyone else who would like to speak, and we'll just be respectful, and wait for him to call on those people. The first person that I've signed up to speak is our Comptroller March Gallagher.

### **Comptroller Gallagher**

I appreciate the time. I wanted to share with you that my office undertook an audit of occupancy tax paid by short-term rentals, that was last month. The objective of the audit was to better understand the registration and collection process. Whether the county is capturing all short-term rental occupancy tax revenue due. And our opportunities to improve collections. Because of COVID into a program audit and a financial audit, it turned out that a lot of the host properties have trouble replying because of the pandemic, but we actually were able to get through it. You can find the full report [silence: audio cuts out] did. And here's what we found. First of all, we found the Department of Finance to be incredibly helpful and accommodating to us and our staff through a very difficult time. We also found that they, Department of Finance, efforts have resulted in substantially increased revenues over the last several years, going from \$1.196 million in revenues [silence: audio cuts out] to \$2.032 million, a 70% increase. So, I want to note that.

That being said, we did find that the Department of Finances systems [silence: audio cuts out]. Most registered properties, when we went through their tax statements, their quarterly statements, many statements, but the majority of those errors were immaterial. There were only small errors, resulting in minor amounts of tax lost. Twenty-five percent of the properties identified through third party research, however, [silence: audio cuts out] completely with the county. And of the pool of that had been identified we were able to locate properties, identified but not rent-registered, however, still listing [long silence] identify property hosts that had attested that they do not rent, still renting in Ulster County, with reviews during the audit period.

### **Comptroller Gallagher**

And furthermore, we identify [silence: audio cuts out] these that third party research vendor did not identify. That happened when we would look for a property couldn't find it, found a neighbor by accident, that no one had ever uncovered. We do not [silence: audio cuts out] separate [silence: audio cuts out]. So, operators separate from hotel and motel. So, we actually cannot track that separately. And we recommended creating a separate general ledger code, like our neighboring counties. For example, so that we can better identify those revenues coming in. And finally, we did recommend entering into an Airbnb Voluntary Collection Agreement (VCA) as well as any other platform that offers it, to collect the tax at the point of sale. And I want to speak very quickly on that. We reviewed other municipal VCA agreements and signing VCA will not prohibit us from asking host properties to respond to an audit request from the Comptroller's Office in the future. Signing a VCA, does not prohibit Ulster County from continuing to retain a third party research firm to identify properties. And in fact, we will need to continue that [silence: audio cuts out] pulling revenues off of other platforms. So, our conclusion is that VCA would bring needed additional revenue to Ulster County without limiting our access to information. Thank you.

### **Chairman Donaldson**

Next speaker, Vicky.

### **Clerk Fabella**

And next speaker is Tom Smiley.



## **Tom Smiley**

Thank you. Thank you very much. I'm Tom Smiley. I'm the CEO of Mohonk Mountain House. Today, I'm speaking on behalf of the Ulster County Lodging Coalition, which is a group of lodging operators, predominantly more traditional hotel motel operators, bed and breakfasts, but we do also have some Airb&b operators within our membership. I'm not sure if I've covered everybody that I see on the call, but within our group tonight, I see Eric Gullickson and Barbara Stirewalt, both with Mohonk Mountain House. Eric is our president, Barbara is our general manager, Tamara Murray from Emerson, and Shelley Turk and Andrew Chafatelli from Rocking Horse Ranch. And then we also have Mark Dorr on the call tonight. He is with New York State Tourism Association. I believe he'll be speaking next. So, thank you for giving us the opportunity to speak to the Legislature. I'm looking over to the side because I'm reading from my notes. I apologize. I'm not looking directly into the camera. But the... this issue seems to come up semi-regularly. It's been coming up for the Lodging Coalition for at least the last eight years, seems to be this perennial item that comes up and... We as a coalition don't want to stand in the way of tax collection. We're also actually interested in some other factors that would level the playing field across hospitality operators and short-term, transient occupancy, that's what our industry calls it. And that is rental for less than 30 days or without a contract, typically.

So, I just want to really start by saying, you know, we're a business that enriches the community. We provide employment opportunities, recreational opportunities, and are the primary businesses to help drive tourism in Ulster County. We, Mohawk Mountain House, has been in operation for over 150 years. Some of our other members have been 40-50-60-year operators. So, we think long term view and we very much have an interest in what's best not just for our community. We, you know, like I said, our interest is a level playing field. So, you know, we'd like to ask Legislators to consider all the factors that come into play and that would include requiring registration for any business operator. And that's really what SDR is, that any of the various platforms, they are all businesses. And make sure that those businesses are operating the same way that we're required to. With health and safety, you know, the licensing, permitting, inspections, all the all the things that we have to do as a short term-rental. We want to make sure that the appropriate health safety standards are actually followed. So, it's permitted, but it's inspected, and it's also making sure that they're even aware of the regulations you need to follow. Make sure they're holding the appropriate insurance and liability coverages for a business as opposed to a home. And then of course, be responsible and pay their taxes just like everybody else is required to. So, you know, really we're asking the coalition... The coalition is asking Legislature to represent the community's interest, and those of our employees, which number in the thousands, focus on the points mentioned above, regarding level playing field and being cautious and wise, not executing any contractual agreement that would shield the business from the requirements of operating in a transparent manner in our community. And in particular, you know, the obligation of a business operator is to pay their taxes. And how they go about collecting those taxes, in this case from their customer, and remitting to the county, is less material in the fact that they're the ones obligated, they owe it. And part of this legislation that, the draft indicates that... So, this is part of the Proposed Local Law No. 7. I believe it's the bottom of the first page, start of the second page. And starts with two points. One is, we've under generated funds by at least half a million dollars in 2019. Two: this is not a tax on the individual tourist grantor, who likely lives outside the County, but instead is a charge to our County's hosts, excuse me, who have no means of collecting this tax from their renter. Through a voluntary contract with the hosting companies, a full tax can be reclaimed from the renter.

Therefore, the overarching purpose of enacting this local law includes generating significant revenue for the county and supporting a balanced economic opportunity in affordable housing. And I've heard this before that the only way to get the short-term rental company to pay the tax is to sign an agreement with them. And that the host can't pay the tax because they can't collect it, because they're not the ones actually processing the transaction with the guests. So, we did a we did a search for local operators. And of Airbnb's website in particular, because the legislation actually calls out Airbnb. There is a means by which any operator can set up their account with Airbnb to have the tax collected on their behalf. And either remit it themselves, or have it remitted through Airbnb. And that's currently available right now. And then if you... we did a search of some of the properties. In Ulster County, there's properties that are currently collecting occupancy tax. So, they don't give you addresses on their listings, but one is titled "Uptown Kingston," ones just as "Pine Bush," It's an entire house by Rita and Joe. Near Belleayre ski area, it's an entire cabin hosted by Christian. Accord, NY, and that one is a private room and a cottage hosted by Carol. And so these are current listings, active right now, that you could book tonight. Where occupancy tax as part of the fees that they quote and collect during the bookings. So, I don't see how, you know, signing this agreement brings any significant advantage to the county.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Alright, anyone else? Um, next?

**Clerk Fabella**

Next speaker signed up is Mark Dorr.

**Mark Dorr**

Hello. This is Mark, President with the New York State Hospitality Tourism Association. Again, thanks for having me. I was down a couple of years ago in person before the COVID hit and I had a good time at the last meeting. I'm just here from a state perspective, just to I guess, in could we deal in all over the state, and we've been locked in trying to get some state legislation done for the last ten years. Kind of been in a wrestling match with Airbnb regarding our legislation and then the part of it that says that there would be a registration process and tax collection. So, they have worked with us and said, "Oh, yeah, that sounds good." And then we move down the line, they say, well, that's... then they spend half a million dollars to get somebody elected in the State Legislature that can put forth their legislation. But I'm just here to encourage you not to give up on the mechanisms that you currently have in place. I was on a call the other, a couple of weeks ago, and as far as New York State goes, Ulster County, and this is why I'm so involved with you folks, is that right now, the mechanism you have is the best one in the state. It just really needs kind of some additional enforcement. And I just want to make sure that you guys keep in mind that enforcement going forward. And the other thing, again, just a word of caution, is because we deal with this a lot is, even at the state level, we get a lot of promises. And yes, we'll do that from the short-term rental folks when it comes to you know, real and actual audits, and the disclosure of registrations. And when it gets right down to it, we start to move the legislation, it becomes, "Oh, no, no, we didn't agree to that, we're not going to share any information with anybody, you're going to have to get it through the legislature, you know, the state legislature." So, some of the biggest cities are engaged in long-term fights, for the details of the people listing in the communities that are being impacted by it. And, you know, they've been in lawsuits for years and years. And my caution is that, you know, if the biggest cities in the world that are having the

struggles and troubles, and going into court to battle them, you know, Ulster County... well, may have good resources that you know, to go into, you know, some legal battles with Airbnb, or whoever it is, on getting the listings and the actual revenue and the audits is going to be daunting. So again, you have a great registration process and I just want to caution entering into something that may cause you more harm over the long-term. I know you guys have been collecting money and you know you're looking to grab, you know, get more money, and I get it, for the county. But I just wanted to caution everybody to be careful on moving forward, thinking that you're going to get Airbnb to buckle to what you're at, spent a lot of time and resources away from the enforcement, into we're going to get them to do X-Y-Z. That's really my caution.

And I'll end with this, because I read it today, and I thought of you guys. I read a lot of biographies. And if you're a sports... sometimes my wife says to me, you know, you read too much about sports. But I wanted to share it, I thought of Ulster County, as reading a biography on Vince Lombardi, it said, and I underline because I was having the meeting tonight. "Anything is ours providing we are willing to pay the price." And then I write, "The price being paid right now, for you folks, and you have already done all the work, you've paid the price, you just need to enforce the mechanism that you have. And the price that everybody has been paid over the last eight years to get that mechanism in place. The worrisome thing for me is that the price that you paid may go away because if you enter into some of these agreements, you lose control of your short-term rental industry, and, you know, the auditing, and the exact money that you're owed. And the reporting, it becomes very diluted. So, that was just my two minutes, was just a caution on going forward. You have a great mechanism in place, and I hope you would consider keeping that, and working toward enforcing it for the long-term goals. And that was it. Thank you for having me.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Thank you. Vicky.

**Clerk Fabella**

Kathy Nolan.

**Kathy Nolan**

Hello. Nice to be here with you all. I completely support the comments of Tom Smiley and Mark Dorr. They've anticipated some of my concerns, but I would highlight the findings that the Legislature is citing at the bottom of page one. I see the claim that the current mechanism has under generated funds by at least half a million in 2019. In one year alone. I don't see any substantiation for that, maybe it was submitted separately by the authors of this resolution, but I would like to see the materials that backed up that claim. And, as Tom Smiley said, there are mechanisms by which these monies can be collected, and they have been being collected from the renter, even if it is the host that is sending it to the county. That money is coming from the renter, who is booking the room with that with that individual. I think that the upfront cost, as Mark Dorr said, of putting the system in place have already been expended, and give us detailed specific information, and keep us in contact with the individual Airbnbs. Even if the Airbnb, or other platforms, would give us aggregate data, but allow us to dig in when we want, we won't know where to dig in. As a scientist, aggregate data is a way that you hide stuff. It is not how you find out what's actually happening. The way we know is to get the individual information. And you can follow trends much more easily on an individual location by looking across a spreadsheet or a

printout of their individual taxes year to year. And note discrepancies, in ways that I think will be very difficult to obtain, if we all have only these host platforms collecting information for us, or even primarily relying on that. So, I see a risk that we would need to duplicate in order to obtain the information that we currently have. And I think that the benefit of having the platform obtain these funds is, you know, there, but it is small, given that we're now getting, you know, very high percentages of collection with doing it the way we've been doing it. And we didn't talk about the cost of going into this system, of having to monitor it, which would be an additional layer of government coming from the Comptroller's office, probably. But why do that and then have the information generated for you directly at the time that the person reports, or doesn't report? So, I think we have a very good system. It's not broken. I don't think we should fix it. I think we should take heed of the statewide organizations telling us that we're the model, with our current system, and not change to go to another system that holds very little benefit for us, especially at this point in time. Thank you.

### **Clerk Fabella**

The next speaker signed up is Supervisor Harris.

### **Shannon Harris**

Hi, I'm Shannon Harris. Thank you. I'm having a little bit of technical issues. So, I hope I don't disappear on you again. I'm speaking today on behalf of the Ulster County Supervisors and Mayor's Association and the Town of Esopus. I agree with the Comptroller's report that we need to collect more revenue from STRs (Short Term Rentals). And there's no debate about that. I do think as an Airbnb host myself, that it would be more convenient for, from a host perspective, to have that automatically taken out of the fees. There are fees that are automatically taken. And if that process were streamlined, I see no problem with that. But on speaking with the Supervisors and Mayor's this morning, there was no support for what this resolution achieves, which we unanimously don't believe it will achieve any desired effect. We believe this resolution is duplicative. It's redundant in that it presents a problem for the Ulster County Executive who already is in negotiations with Airbnb to have an agreement. And attempt to reach that agreement in consideration of some of the important aspects of municipal and local oversight. And in order to achieve an agreement that has that specificity in it, to put the municipalities at an advantage with their regulatory control over short-term rentals and in our local markets, we need to have the best agreement possible. If the Legislature makes a statement, on the public record, it compromises the negotiations that are already ongoing that take into account very important details that impact the localities. It creates, signing the agreement a *fait accompli* with Airbnb. That brings us to another problem that the supervisors have concern about which is it only focuses on Airbnb. There are other platforms that are equally competitive. This is just targeting one brand. And it's a real, to us it seems like it's potentially harmful to the negotiation process, and it's a waste of time because it's already happening. So, it doesn't really solve anything except risks some of the negotiation terms that are currently in process. The supervisors also, were dismayed at how we were approached by the sponsor, one of the sponsors, Legislator Walter. We were approached by Legislator Walter on the call that we had several months ago, and we even had a follow-up that to that call and gave lots of feedback...

**Chairman Donaldson**

Please don't address anybody, any of the legislators directly, if you want to talk about it, don't address the legislators directly, or bring their names up. Thank you.

**Sharron**

Okay. We were dismayed at the approach because the feedback that we provided was not taken into account and those issues that I just spoke about were reiterated at that time. So, all in all, there's concern about this resolution and what it achieves. We don't believe it's meaningful. We think In fact, it's a waste of time and duplicative at this point. And that's all I wish to say.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Thank you.

**Clerk Fabella**

I have no one else that has signed up.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Is there anyone that has not signed up wish to speak? Others listening in? Does anyone that is signed up wish to speak, that has not signed up? I'm sorry, wish to speak?

**Andrew Chafatelli**

Hi, this is Andrew Charatelli from Rocking Horse Ranch.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Okay.

**Andrew Chafatelli**

I thank you guys for having us on tonight. So, I just want to make a comment because earlier I said, you know, we can identify these properties, on the Airbnb, we can even see people leaving reviews. So, we know who they are. We know that they're actively renting their houses. So, I just want to also say, I support what Mark and Tom and Kathy said, you know, we're just, all we're missing here is the enforcement. And we need to figure out how do we enforce the legislation that's already on the books. Because we've come so far. Ulster County is doing a great job. Let's work on the enforcement because that's really what levels the playing field for us in the hospitality business here and the hotel business.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Does anyone else that is on the call wish to speak? I'm looking. Anyone else wish to speak, unmute them self and yell out, I guess. I'm trying to keep everybody on here, trying to see, I've got two screens. All right, it looks like there's no one else that wishes to speak. I'd entertain a motion to adjourn this first public hearing. Mr. Litts.

**Legislator Litts**

Chairman, I will make a motion to close the public hearing.

**Chairman Donaldson**

You're very good at that, Legislator Litts. And a second?

**Chairman Donaldson**

Seconded by Legislator Bruno. And the first public hearing is closed.

**Chairman Donaldson**

And Madam Clerk, could you call the second public hearing?

**Legislator Litts**

We have to take a vote on the motion?

**Chairman Donaldson**

I'm sorry. You're right. You're exactly... that's why you're so good at this. I knew I could count on you. I take a vote. All those in favor?

**Legislative Members**

Aye. (All members)

**Chairman Donaldson**

Any against? None. Adjourned.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Now, you may call me second public hearing.

**Clerk Fabella**

Tonight's second public hearing is on PROPOSED LOCAL LAW NO. 4 of 2020, A Local Law Establishing Certain Consumer Protection Practices In Ulster County And Penalties For Violating Same.

**Clerk Fabella**

And we have no one who is signed up.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Does to anyone that's here wish to speak? Anyone wish to speak on the issue, if you do call out. Normally, we don't do that but it certainly helps when I'm looking through three screens.

**Chairman Donaldson**

All right.

**Legislator Litts**

Hearing none, Mr. Chairman, I'll make a motion to close the public hearing.

**Chairman Donaldson**

All right, Legislator Bruno, are you second that, right?

**Legislator Bruno**

I'll second that one too.

**Chairman Donaldson**

All right. You're very good at that.

**Chairman Donaldson**

All those in favor?

**Legislative Members**

Aye. (All members)

**Chairman Donaldson**

Any opposed?

**Chairman Donaldson**

Second public hearing is closed.

**Chairman Donaldson**

There we go. Call for the third public hearing Madam Clerk.

**Clerk Fabella**

Tonight's third and final public hearing is on the Tentative Budget for Ulster County Community College For The Year 2020-2021.

**Clerk Fabella**

And there is no one who is signed up ahead of time for that hearing either.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Alrighty. Does anyone that's out there wish to speak? Anyone wish to speak? You know, yell out if you do.

**Chairman Donaldson**

All right, hearing none, Legislator Litts, do your thing.

**Legislator Litts**

I'll make a motion to close the public hearing. Mr. Chairman.



**Chairman Donaldson**

Alrighty.

**Legislator Bruno**

And I'll second it.

**Kathy Nolan**

Legislator Bruno has a question

**Legislator Bruno**

No. Actually, that was a second again.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Very good. All those in favor?

**Legislative Members**

Aye. (All members)

**Chairman Donaldson**

Any opposed?

**Legislator Bruno**

Thanks, Kathy.

**Chairman Donaldson**

The third, public hearing is closed and we'll go back into Ways and Means. Take a five-minute break and within, what is it, yeah, in 6:55, we'll open that back up again.

**Legislator Ronk**

Everyone remember, just click the same link as the last one for Ways and Means.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Yes, very good. Thank you, Ken.

**Legislator Litts**

Mr. Chairman, I'll make a motion for adjournment.

**Chairman Donaldson**

Alrighty? I thought we just did that.

**Legislator Litts**

No, you just said you were going to go back to Ways and Means.

**Legislator Ronk**

I'll second it.



**Chairman Donaldson**

Right. All those in favor?

**Legislative Members**

Aye. (All members)

**Chairman Donaldson**

I don't think we needed to do that. We already adjourned, and it was three meetings.

**Legislator Ronk**

Herbie just likes to adjourn so much. You know.

**Legislator Bruno**

There you go.

**Chairman Donaldson**

He's such an adourner.

**Legislator Litts**

I like to keep things moving.