Laws & Rules, Governmental Services Committee Regular Meeting Minutes

DATE & TIME:	November 21, 2016 – 6:30 PM
LOCATION:	KL Binder Library, 6th Floor, County Office Building
PRESIDING OFFICER:	Chairman Kevin Roberts
LEGISLATIVE STAFF:	Jay Mahler, Deputy Clerk
PRESENT:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Rodriguez and Chairman Ronk
ABSENT:	Legislator R. Parete
QUORUM PRESENT:	Yes

OTHER ATTENDEES: Legislators Allen & Berky, Legislative Counsel Pascale, Tom Kadgen & Vic Melville – League of Women Voters, Dorraine Whitney – Ulster County Insurance Department, Evan Gallo – Ulster County Comptroller's Office, Tom & Beverly Delaney – Shawangunk Kennel Club

Chairman Roberts called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Motion No. 1:	Moved to Approve the Minutes of the October 17 & October 18, 2016 meetings
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Donaldson
Discussion:	None
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Minutes APPROVED

Resolutions for the November 22, 2016 Session of the Legislature

Chairman Roberts advised the members that he would be taking Resolution No. 465 out of order to accommodate Ms. Dorraine Whitney, Insurance Officer from the county Insurance Department.

Resolution No. 465: Approving The Execution Of A Contract In Excess Of \$50,000.00 Entered Into By The County – NCA Comp Inc –Insurance Department

Resolution Summary: This resolution approves the execution of a contract with NCA Comp Inc in the amount of \$771,833 for self-insurance and workers comp third party administrator for the period 1/1/17 - 12/31/19.

Motion No. 2:	Moved to adopt Resolution No. 465
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Rodriguez

Discussion:

Chairman Roberts recognized Ms. Whitney from the Insurance Office and asked the members if they had any questions for her. Legislator Donaldson asked Ms. Whitney if the contract was for the services that used to be provided in house, but is now provided by a company in Rochester. He stated that he would not be supporting the Resolution because of the loss of county jobs.

Ms. Whitney stated that the company operated out of Buffalo and Syracuse. She informed the members that the contract covered a statutory requirement for worker compensation. She added that the partnership with NCA Comp began in 2014 and they have saved the county millions. Legislator Donaldson asked how those saving were realized. Ms. Whitney responded that the company aggressively settles cases and was chosen out of seven vendors through a thorough vetting process by an RFP committee. Legislator Donaldson stated that he felt the work could be done in house.

Ms. Whitney informed the members that there are resources available to the county now that did not exist in the past which allow for more aggressive claims processing and closing of cases. Legislator Belfiglio asked how many people it would take for the county to administer the program in house. Ms. Whitney responded that there were eleven people in the office before and they could barely manage the work load. Legislator Belfiglio commented that the contract amount was for three years and was far cheaper than hiring 10 - 15 people. She added that there has been too much time since the county administered the program and too many regulatory changes which would make it virtually impossible for the county to take over the administration again. Chairman Roberts asked of the members had any other questions for Ms. Whitney. Hearing none, he thanked her for her time.

Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Roberts, Rodriguez & Ronk
Voting Against:	Legislator Donaldson
Votes in Favor:	4
Votes Against:	1
Disposition:	Resolution ADOPTED

Resolution No. 391: Setting A Public Hearing On Proposed Local Law No. 14 of 2016 (A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers) To Be Held On Tuesday, December 13, 2016 At 6:05 PM

Resolution Summary: This resolution sets a public hearing for Tuesday, December 13, 2016 at 6:05 PM to allow the public to offer comments on Proposed Local Law Number 14 of 2016.

Motion No. :	Moved for discussion
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Belfiglio

Discussion:

Chairman Ronk informed the members that there were a number of amendments he was proposing to address concerns brought up ant the last meeting. He read each proposed amendment.

Motion No. 3:	Moved to AMEND Proposed Local Law No. 14 of 2016 to read in the form attached
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Donaldson
	t t
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Amendments ADOPTED

Discussion:

Legislator Donaldson asked if he could hear from the pet sellers who were in attendance. Mr. Delaney said that there were a number of people who were strong advocates of the law as well as those who strongly opposed it and he understood the basic intention of the law was to ensure that the breeding of dogs in the county is conducted responsibly. He thanked Chairman Ronk for working with him to get the law to a compromise form that should be acceptable for all of the extreme opinions on the issue. Chairman Ronk thanked the Delaneys for all of the time they spent working on the law instead of simply opposing it. He added that the work that was spent over the last year was an example of how effective collaboration can be.

Chairman Roberts asked how much of the law was duplicative of state law which could not be changed. Chairman Ronk responded that a lot of it was out of NYS Agriculture & Markets Law. He added that all of the standards of care portions of the local law were covered by the Agriculture and Markets Law.

Motion No. 4:	Moved to Adopt Resolution No. 391 with the Proposed Local Law as amended
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Donaldson
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Resolution ADOPTED
-	

Chairman Roberts advised the members that, out of consideration for Deputy Comptroller Gallo, he would be moving on to New Business on the agenda to discuss the Comptroller's 2017 Audit Plan.

Chairman Roberts said that Mr. Gallo had asked him and Legislator Donaldson for some advice and recognized Mr. Gallo to explain the Audit Plan. Mr. Gallo stated that he had contacted the Chairs and Deputy Chairs of each Standing Committee for input on the 2017 Audit Plan. He informed the members that for the past two years they were utilizing a survey completed by each department that identified some areas that may have needed further review. He said the feedback was being requested from Legislators in order to stay relevant. He informed the members that a few Legislators had responded with suggestions including foster care, mental health services and other DSS related items. He thanked the members for inviting him and for their consideration.

Chairman Roberts thanked Mr. Gallo for attending and asked the members if they had any questions for him. Legislator Belfiglio stated that he had forwarded his feedback and commented that the biggest cost centers in county contracts should have performance reports evaluating cost effectiveness. He gave an example of the multiple contracts the county has with Family of Woodstock and the amount of money being spent on institutional foster care.

Legislator Donaldson echoed Legislator Belfiglio's comments and questioned why the costs of foster care were increasing. He also stated that numerous people have reached out to him about services they no longer receive after mental health services were privatized. He asked if there was some way to assess care provided pre and post privatization. He added that he understood that it would not be easy to quantify, but felt it needed to be evaluated. Mr. Gallo agreed that the question of how to measure an individual's health would be difficult to answer. Legislator Rodriguez said he has shared a list of requests with the Comptroller. He advised the members that one of the items on his list was the "under-hired" lines in the budget; lines that remain unfilled for extensive periods of time. He added that he has brought the subject up during the budget process in the past and will continue to do so. He also mentioned a need for outcome assessments of programs.

Chairman Roberts questioned whether it was the role of the Comptroller to evaluate the type of care individuals receive as opposed to a strictly financial assessment. Legislator Rodriguez responded that there were some programmatic assessments that could be done such as an evaluation as to whether there was an increase or decrease in incarcerations due to an improvement or decline in services. He said that economic development was another area that received substantial county funding and could be assessed in various ways, ie: job creation, median income increases, etc.

Chairman Ronk stated that foster care costs have been increasing all over the region. He said he spoke to the budget consultants who confirmed the increase and speculated that the heroin and opioid crisis could be a major contributing factor. The members discussed the various programs in the county that serve Ulster County troubled youth, like CASA. Legislator Belfiglio commented that the cost per child in institutional foster care is upwards of \$500,000.

Chairman Roberts thanked Mr. Gallo for his time. Legislator Allen commented that he agreed with Legislator Belfiglio about niche areas in government where services are provided by very few private companies; creating a lack of competition in certain industries.

Resolution No. 449: Confirming ReAppointment Of Member To The Ulster County Board Of Ethics

Resolution Summary: This resolution confirms the County Executive's reappointment of Alan Lomita to the Ulster County Board of Ethics.

Motion No. 5:	Moved to ADOPT Resolution No. 449
Motion By:	Legislator Rodriguez
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Ronk
Discussion:	None
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Resolution ADOPTED

Resolution No. 450: Adopting Proposed Local Law No. 13 of 2016, (A Local Law Amending The Code Of The County Of Ulster To Limit The Gifts That County Officers And Employees May Receive)

Resolution Summary: This resolution adopts Proposed Local Law No. 13 of 2016.

Motion No. 6:	Moved to ADOPT Resolution No. 450
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Rodriguez
Discussion:	None
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Resolution ADOPTED

Resolution No. 458: Setting A Public Hearing On Proposed Local Law No. 19 Of 2016 (A Local Law Amending The Ulster County Charter, (Local Law No. 2 Of 2006), And Amending The Administrative Code For the County Of Ulster, (Local Law No. 10 Of 2008), To Modify The Term Of The Chairman And The Clerk Of The Legislature) To Be Held On Tuesday, December 13, 2016 At 6:30 PM

Resolution Summary: This resolution sets a public hearing for Tuesday, December 13, 2016 at 6:30 PM to allow the public to offer comments on Proposed Local Law Number 19 of 2016.

Motion No. 7:	Moved for DISCUSSION
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Belfiglio

Discussion:

Chairman Roberts recognized Legislator Allen, sponsor of the law. Legislator Allen advised the members that he would like to make an amendment based on discussions he had with individual legislators.

Motion No. 8:	Moved to amend Section 1 and of Proposed Local Law No. 19 of 2016
	to read as follows:

At this organizational meeting, the members of the Legislature shall select a Chairman at the call of the Clerk of the Legislature in each year. DURING THE FIRST ORGANIZATIONAL MEETING FOR EACH NEW COUNTY LEGISLATURE, THE MEMBERS OF THE COUNTY LEGISLATURE SHALL ELECT A CHAIRMAN AT THE CALL OF THE CLERK OF THE LEGISLATURE. THE CHAIRMAN SHALL SERVE FOR THE DURATION OF THE CHAIRMAN'S TERM AS LEGISLATOR. THE REMOVAL OF THE CHAIRMAN SHALL BE BY A MOTION FROM THE FLOOR DURING A MEETING OF THE COUNTY LEGISLATURE BY A FAVORABLE VOTE OF AT LEAST THREE-QUARTERS THREE FIFTHS OF THE WHOLE NUMBER OF THE LEGISLATURE. The Chairman shall appoint members of the County Legislature to serve on such committees as are provided by the rules of such Legislature. The Clerk of the County Legislature shall preside at all meetings of the Legislature until such time as a Chairman has been designated by election or appointment. The failure to elect a Chairman or appoint committee members shall not prevent the County Legislature from transacting its ordinary business.

Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Rodriguez
	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Amendments ADOPTED
Motion No. 9:	Moved to Adopt Resolution No. 458 with the Proposed Local Law as
	amended
Motion By:	Legislator Ronk
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Rodriguez

Discussion:

Legislator Donaldson commented that he supported increasing the term of the Clerk of the Legislature to two years, but felt that the term of the Chairman should remain one year. He added

that during his time in the Legislature no Chairman was ever replaced mid-term and felt the change was not necessary and was not good for the body. Legislator Rodriguez stated that he felt that the three-fifths vote was a good compromise. He mentioned there was only one Chairman in history who served one year and it was due to a change in employment. The members discussed terms of previous chairmen.

The members discussed splitting the local law into two separate laws and whether the rules allowed for splitting local laws. There was also a brief discussion as to whether the change in terms required a ballot referendum. Chairman Roberts requested Legislative Counsel provide an opinion on whether a referendum would be required and if the law could be divided in committee. Legislator Allen stated the he would prefer not to split the laws.

Counselor Pascale stated that he reached out to Counselor Guerin and they both agreed that a referendum was not required in this instance. Chairman Roberts called for a vote on the resolution.

Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Rodriguez and Ronk	
Voting Against:	Legislators Donaldson and Roberts	
Votes in Favor:	3	
Votes Against:	2	
Disposition:	Resolution ADOPTED	
-		

Resolution No. 459: Amending The Rules Of Order To Ensure Standing Committee Assignments Correspond With The Term Of The Legislature

Resolution Summary: This resolution amends the Rules of Order of the Legislature regarding the duration of standing committee assignments.

Motion No. 10:	Moved to ADOPT Resolution No. 459
Motion By:	Legislator Belfiglio
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Ronk

Discussion:

Legislator Donaldson expressed his opinion that the Chairman should have the opportunity to change committee assignments if he or she needs to. Legislator Rodriguez commented that he has seen vengeful Chairs create chaos in the body by changing assignments mid-term out of spite.

Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Rodriguez and Ronk	
Voting Against:	Legislators Donaldson and Roberts	
Votes in Favor:	3	
Votes Against:	2	
Disposition:	Resolution ADOPTED	
_		

Resolution No. 425: Condemning Violence And Hate Speech And Expressing Solidarity With Muslims And All Those Targeted For Their Ethnicity, Race Or Religion

Resolution Summary: This resolution condemns all hateful speech and violent action directed at Muslims, those perceived to be Muslims, immigrants and people of color and affirms the Legislature's commitment to pursuing a policy agenda that affirms civil and human rights, and ensures that those targeted on the basis of race, religion or immigration status can turn to government without fear of recrimination.

Motion No. 11:	Moved for DISCUSSION
Motion By:	Legislator Belfiglio
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Rodriguez

Discussion:

Legislator Belfiglio stated that he took offense with the heading of the Resolution because it singles out Muslims and should refer to all people. He added that he wasn't sure if the resolution was memorializing or was setting policy. Legislator Rodriguez stated that the resolution was clearly a sense of the body and was not setting policy. Counselor Pascale advised the members that the lack of a Resolve requesting the resolution is forwarded to other governing bodies or policy makers creates some ambiguity as to the memorializing nature of the resolution. Legislator Belfiglio suggested adding all ethnicities. The members discussed the instances where individual groups were singled out for support. Legislator Donaldson stated that Muslims are being targeted at this time in history and the Legislature should recognize that it is wrong. Legislator Rodriguez stated he would be fine with clarifying the resolution. Legislator Berky stated there are a couple of instances in the resolution which refers to all individuals. Chairman Ronk stated that people were also being harassed because of their political views and recommended that be added as well. The members discussed the recent Presidential Election and national news stories relating to the subject of the resolution.

The members went through the resolution in detail and proposed a number of amendments.

Motion No. 12: Motion By: Motion Seconded By:	Moved to AMEND the Resolution to read in the form attached Legislator Belfiglio Legislator Roberts
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk
Voting Against:	None
Votes in Favor:	5
Votes Against:	0
Disposition:	Amendments ADOPTED
Motion No. 13:	Moved to POSTPONE Resolution No. 425 as amended to a Special Meeting of the committee to be held on November 22, 2016 at 6:50 PM

Motion By:	Legislator Rodriguez	
Motion Seconded By:	Legislator Ronk	
Voting In Favor:	Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, Roberts, Rodriguez and Ronk	
Voting Against:	None	
Votes in Favor:	5	
Votes Against:	0	
Disposition:	Resolution POSTPONED	
-		

Chairman Roberts moved on to the following Resolutions under Old Business on the agenda:

Resolution No. 411: Setting A Public Hearing On Proposed Local Law No. 15 of 2016 (A Local Law Amending The Ulster County Charter Section C-101A And The Ulster County Administrative Code Section A 30-2A, To Amend The Powers And Duties Of The Ulster County Human Rights Commission) To Be Held On Tuesday, November 15, 2016 At 6:15 PM

Resolution Summary: This resolution sets a public hearing for Tuesday, November 15, 2016 at 6:15 PM to allow the public to offer comments on Proposed Local Law Number 15 of 2016.

Resolution No. 412: Setting A Public Hearing On Proposed Local Law No. 16 of 2016 (A Local Law Establishing A Comprehensive Ulster County Human Rights Law) To Be Held On Tuesday, November 15, 2016 At 6:20 PM

Resolution Summary: This resolution sets a public hearing for Tuesday, November 15, 2016 at 6:20 PM to allow the public to offer comments on Proposed Local Law Number 16 of 2016.

Resolution No. 448: Setting A Public Hearing On Proposed Local Law No. 18 of 2016 (A Local Law Prohibiting Discrimination On The Basis Of Gender Identity At Places Of Public Accommodation, Resort Or Amusement) To Be Held On Tuesday, November 15, 2016 At 6:30 PM

Resolution Summary: This resolution sets a public hearing for Tuesday, November 15, 2016 at 6:30 PM to allow the public to offer comments on Proposed Local Law Number 18 of 2016.

Discussion:

Legislator Donaldson asked if Resolution No. 448 pertaining to Local Law No. 18 was still necessary as Local Law 16 would cover it. Legislator Rodriguez responded that the sponsor requested it continue to be included. He added that there was difficulty in scheduling a special meeting of the committee to discuss the laws. Chairman Ronk suggested creating a subcommittee to discuss the laws. Legislator Berky commented that she was hoping to arrive at some consensus on the law. Chairman Ronk responded that he believed there was an impasse between the opinion of Legislative Counsel and Minority Counsel regarding the enforcement section. Legislator Berky asked who the legislature could ask for an opinion since the counsels disagreed. Chairman Robert commented that regardless of the question of legality, the law would require an expansion of the Human Rights Commission's power. Legislator Rodriguez asked if a date could be settled on.

Chairman Roberts appointed Legislator Rodriguez to Chair a subcommittee to review the three laws, as well as Legislators Belfiglio and Donaldson.

Chairman Roberts asked if there was any other business; hearing none,

Adjournment

Motion Made By:Legislator RonkMotion Seconded By:Legislator RobertsNo. of Votes in Favor:5No. of Votes Against:0

<u>TIME:</u> 8:20 PM Respectfully submitted: Jay Mahler, Deputy Clerk Minutes Approved: December 19, 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

BE IT ENACTED, by the Legislature of the County of Ulster, as follows:

SECTION 1. LEGISLATIVE INTENT.

Many Ulster County residents own dogs and cats. The Ulster County Legislature finds that Ulster County residents feel a great deal of affection for their dogs and cats and consider them to be a part of their family and, accordingly, invest significant amounts of money in their care and maintenance. Dogs and cats are made available to the public from a number of different sources including, but not limited to, breeders, dealers, and pet sellers. The Legislature finds that breeders, dealers, and pet sellers vary in their treatment of cats and dogs and that some operate substandard commercial facilities that expose dogs and cats to inhumane and unsafe living conditions. The Legislature further finds that some breeders, dealers, and pet sellers will sell animals that are unfit for sale due to, among other things, diseases or congenital conditions. Therefore, the Legislature deems that the regulation of breeders, dealers, and pet sellers is necessary to protect the health, safety, and general welfare of Ulster County residents.

SECTION 2. DEFINITIONS.

As used in this Local Law, the following terms shall have the meanings indicated:

1. "Animal" means a dog or cat.

2. "Person" means any individual, corporation, partnership, association, municipality or other legal entity.

3. "Consumer" means any individual purchasing an animal from a Pet Seller or a Residential Breeder. A Pet Seller or a Residential Breeder shall not be considered a Consumer.

4. "Pet Seller" means any person in Ulster County who engages in the sale or offering for sale of more than nine (9) or more dogs or cats per calendar year or who breeds more than two (2) litters of dogs or cats per calendar year for sale to the public for profit. This definition shall not include a "Residential Breeder". Nor

- Page 2 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

shall this definition include duly incorporated humane societies or animal protective associations dedicated to the care of unwanted animals which make such animals available for adoption, whether or not a fee is charged for such adoption.

5. "Dog Dealer" means any person who:

(a)Sells dogs belonging to such person that he or she has not bred on his or her own premises to a Pet Seller in Ulster County for resale to a Consumer, or;

(b)Transfers dogs belonging to another to a Pet Seller in Ulster County for any type of consideration, fee, commission or percentage of sales price.

6. "Dog Source Breeder" means any person who sells dogs he or she has bred on his or her own premises for resale by a Dog Dealer or Pet Seller in Ulster County.

7. "Residential Breeder" means a breeder who sells or offers to sell directly to a Consumer more than fifteen animals per year that are born and raised on the breeder's primary residential premises and shall not be considered a Pet Seller as a result of selling or offering to sell such animals.

8. "Primary enclosure" means a structure that restricts an animal's ability to move in a limited amount of space, most commonly a cage, kennel, room or other enclosed compartment.

9. "Housing facility" means a structure that provides animals with shelter, protection from the elements and protection from extremes of temperature. A housing facility may contain primary enclosures as defined in this section.

10. "Department" means the Ulster County Department of Health.

11. "Commissioner" means the Commissioner of the Ulster County Department of Health.

12. "Non-elective surgical procedure" means a surgical procedure that is necessary to preserve or restore the health of an animal, to prevent an animal from

- Page 3 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

experiencing pain or discomfort, or to correct a condition that would interfere with an animal's ability to walk, run, jump or otherwise function in a normal manner.

13. "Clinically ill" means an illness that is apparent to a veterinarian based on observation, examination or testing of an animal or upon review of the medical records relating to the animal.

SECTION 3. PET SELLERS – PERMIT REQUIRED.

1. It is unlawful for any Pet Seller to display, offer for sale, sell, barter or exchange for any consideration, any dog or cat within Ulster County without first obtaining a Pet Seller's permit from the Commissioner.

2. The Commissioner shall issue permits to Pet Sellers only upon proof that the animals displayed, offered for sale or sold by such sellers are raised and maintained in accordance with the terms contained in this Local Law.

3. For purposes of this Local Law, a dog or cat is raised and maintained in a safe and healthy manner when:

(a) The dog or cat is kept by a Pet Seller in compliance with the minimum standards of care required by Section 9 of this Local Law, and

(b) (For dogs only) The dog was obtained from a Dog Source Breeder who keeps dogs in compliance with the minimum standards of care required by Section 13 of this Local Law, and

(c) Compliance with paragraph (a) of this subdivision shall be established through inspection by the Commissioner in accordance with Section 8 of this Local Law and compliance with paragraph (b) of this subdivision shall be established by the certification required by Section 12 of this Local Law.

- Page 4 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

SECTION 4. RESIDENTIAL BREEDERS – PERMIT REQUIRED.

1. It is unlawful for any Residential Breeder to display, offer for sale, sell, barter or exchange for any consideration, any more than fifteen (15) dogs or cats within Ulster County without first obtaining a Residential Breeder's permit from the Commissioner.

2. The Commissioner shall issue permits to Residential Breeders only upon proof that the animals displayed, offered for sale or sold by such breeders are raised and maintained in accordance with Section 14 of this Local Law.

3. A Residential Breeder permit shall be valid for five years from the date of issue.

SECTION 5. PERMITS.

1. No person shall operate as a Pet Seller or a Residential Breeder in Ulster County unless such person holds the appropriate permit issued by the Commissioner. A Pet Seller or Residential Breeder in operation as a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder on or before the effective date of this section, who has filed an application for an initial permit under this Local Law shall be authorized to operate without such permit until the Commissioner grants, or after notice and an opportunity to be heard, declines to grant such permit. Each application for a permit shall be made on a form supplied by the Department and shall contain such information as may be required by the Department. Renewal applications for Pet Seller permits shall be submitted to the Commissioner at least thirty (30) days prior to the commencement of the next permit year. Residential Breeders shall submit renewal applications for Residential Breeder permits to the Commissioner at least thirty (30) days prior to the expiration of the five-year permit.

2. Proof to the satisfaction of the Commissioner of compliance with the requirements of this Local Law and with other applicable provisions of this Local Law shall precede issuance of a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit.

3. Prior to the issuance of a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit, the Pet Seller or Residential Breeder shall provide proof that it is in compliance with the

- Page 5 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

requirements of this Local Law and any rules or regulations thereunder. Upon approval by the Commissioner the appropriate permit shall be issued.

4. The Commissioner shall provide a copy of the permit to the Pet Seller or Residential Breeder and retain the original permit.

5. No Pet Seller or Residential Breeder shall publish or advertise the sale or availability of any dog or cat unless the publication or advertisement is accompanied by the Pet Seller's or Residential Breeder's permit number. Notwithstanding the foregoing, a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder in operation on or before the effective date of this Local Law who has filed an application for an initial permit may publish or advertise the sale or availability of any dog or cat without the publication or advertisement being accompanied by the Pet Seller's or Residential Breeder's permit number until the Commissioner grants, or, after notice and an opportunity to be heard, declines to grant such permit.

6. Pet Sellers or Residential Breeders shall conspicuously display their permits on the premises where the animals are kept for sale so that they can be seen by potential Consumers.

SECTION 6. PERMIT REFUSAL, SUSPENSION, OR REVOCATION.

1. Convictions. The Commissioner shall not issue or renew, and shall suspend or revoke a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit issued pursuant to Section 4 of this Local Law based on a conviction of a violation of any provision of Article Twenty-Six of the Agriculture and Markets Law, or equivalent in the Penal Law, or regulations promulgated thereunder pertaining to the inhumane treatment of animals, cruelty to animals, endangering the life or welfare of an animal, or violation of federal, state or local law pertaining to the care, treatment, sale, possession, or handling of animals or any regulation or rule promulgated pursuant thereto relating to the endangerment of the life or health of an animal.

2. Outstanding fines or penalties. The Commissioner shall not issue or renew a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit if there are unpaid or outstanding fines,

- Page 6 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

penalties, or forfeitures imposed by the Commissioner for violations of this Local Law.

3. Outstanding uncorrected violations. The Commissioner shall not issue a new permit to any Pet Seller or Residential Breeder who has any outstanding, uncorrected violations of this Local Law.

4. The Commissioner may decline to grant or renew, or may suspend or revoke a Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit based on the following grounds:

(a) Material misstatement in the permit application, or

(b) Material misstatement in or falsification of records required to be kept pursuant to this Local Law, or under any regulation promulgated thereunder, or

(c) Failure to allow the Commissioner or his or her authorized agents to inspect records or the Pet Seller's or Residential Breeder's facilities.

5. The acceptance of an application for a new permit shall not prevent the Commissioner from taking any action that he or she deems necessary, including but not limited to, denial of a permit if an investigation or pre-permit inspection discloses conditions or circumstances indicating that a new permit should not be issued.

6. Any Pet Seller or Residential Breeder who is found to be in violation of this Local Law may have their Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit suspended for up to three (3) months for a first offense; up to six (6) months for a second offense within a two (2) year period; or revoked for a third offense within a two (2) year period. Before any Pet Seller or Residential Breeder permit shall be suspended or revoked, the Commissioner, or any hearing officer he or she may designate, shall hold a hearing upon due notice to the permit holder in accordance with regulations promulgated by the Department. Any such violator may also be required to complete a training program designated by the Department prior to reinstatement of such license.

- Page 7 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

7. Any action of the Commissioner may be subject to judicial review in a proceeding under Article Seventy-Eight of the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

SECTION 7. ADMINISTRATION AND ENFORCEMENT.

e

1. The Commissioner, in consultation with the Ulster County Board of Health, is hereby authorized to promulgate any rules, regulations, and procedures necessary to implement this Local Law.

2. The provisions of this Local Law may shall be enforced concurrently by the Department and by any duly incorporated animal welfare organization to which the County has delegated the Commissioner's inspection authority.

<u>SECTION 8.</u> INSPECTION OF PET SELLERS.

- 1. The Commissioner or the Commissioner's authorized agents shall inspect a Pet Seller's or a Residential Breeder's facilities at the Commissioner's discretion to ensure compliance with the provisions of this Local Law.
- 2. The Commissioner may, pursuant to an agreement entered into with a duly incorporated not for profit animal welfare organization, delegate to such organization the authority to conduct inspections of a Pet Sellers' or a Residential Breeder's facilities and to respond to complaints concerning Pet Sellers or Residential Breeders made to the Commissioner.

3. 2. Any person conducting an inspection of a Pet Seller or a Residential Breeder or responding to a complaint concerning a Pet Seller or a Residential Breeder pursuant to this Local Law shall be **a county employee** specifically trained in the proper care of cats and dogs and in the investigation and identification of animal cruelty. The Commissioner may promulgate regulations governing the form and content of such training.

- Page 8 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

SECTION 9. PET SELLERS – MINIMUM STANDARDS OF CARE.

1. Pet Sellers shall comply with the following minimum standards of care for every dog or cat in their custody or possession.

(a) Housing.

(1) Except where dogs or cats are permitted to roam freely inside a Pet Seller's residential premises, animals shall be housed in primary enclosures or cages that are structurally sound and maintained in good repair so as to prevent the dog or cat from escaping from the enclosure and protect it from injury. Surfaces shall be impervious and not permit absorption of fluids and allow thorough and repeated cleaning and disinfection without deteriorating or retaining odors. "Impervious surfaces" may include sealed concrete, ceramic tile, sealed wood, stainless steel or other materials that do not permit absorption of fluids, allow thorough and repeated cleaning and disinfection without deteriorating or retaining odors, and do not violate any other provision contained within this Section.

(2) Primary enclosures or cages housing animals shall provide sufficient space to allow each animal adequate freedom of movement to make normal postural adjustments including the ability to stand up, sit, turn around, and lie down with its limbs outstretched. If the flooring is constructed of metal strands, such strands must be greater than one-eighth inch in diameter (nine gauge) and be coated with a material such as plastic or fiberglass, and shall be constructed so as not to allow passage of any part of an animal's foot through any opening on the floor of the enclosure. The flooring must be in good repair and must not sag or bend between structural supports.

(3) Housing facilities shall be adequately ventilated at all times to provide for the health and well-being of the animal. Ventilation shall be provided by natural or mechanical means, such as windows, vents, fans or air conditioners. Ventilation shall be established to minimize drafts, odors, ammonia levels and moisture condensation.

- Page 9 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(4) The temperature surrounding the animal shall be compatible with the health and well-being of the animal. Temperature shall be regulated by heating and cooling to sufficiently protect each animal from extremes of temperature and shall not be permitted to fall below or rise above ranges which would pose a health hazard to the animal. This shall include supplying shade from sunlight by natural or artificial means.

(5) Indoor housing facilities shall have adequate lighting sufficient to permit routine inspection and cleaning and arranged so that each animal is protected from excessive illumination, which may pose a health hazard to the animal. Animal areas must be provided with regular diurnal light cycle of either natural or artificial light.

(6) The indoor and outdoor facilities housing the dog or cat, including the primary enclosure or cage shall be kept in a clean and sanitary condition in order to provide animals with a safe and healthy living environment. They shall be designed to allow for efficient elimination of waste and water in order to keep the animal dry and prevent it from coming into contact with these substances, except water for drinking purposes. If drains are used they shall be constructed in a manner to minimize foul odors and backup of sewage. If a drainage system is used it shall comply with federal, state, and local laws relating to pollution control.

(7) In the event that a Pet Seller has a pregnant or nursing dog on the Pet Seller's premises, the Pet Seller shall provide a whelping box for such dog. Each nursing dog shall be provided with an additional amount of floor space, based on her breed and behavioral characteristics in accordance with generally accepted husbandry practices as determined by a licensed veterinarian.

(8) Pet Sellers shall designate and provide an isolation area for animals that exhibit symptoms of or are known to be harboring a contagious disease or illness. This designated area must be in a location that prevents or reduces the spread of disease or illness to

- Page 10 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

healthy animals and must otherwise meet all housing requirements of this section.

(b) Sanitation.

(1) Housing facilities and primary enclosures contained within those facilities shall be kept in a clean and sanitary condition in order to maintain a safe and healthy environment for the animal. This shall include removing and destroying any agents injurious to the animals, where appropriate, and periodic cleanings.

(2) Primary enclosures must be cleaned daily and sanitized at least once every two weeks using one of the following methods:

(i) Live steam under pressure;

(ii) Washing with water with a temperature of at least 180 degrees Fahrenheit and with soap or detergent;

(iii) Washing all soiled surfaces with appropriate detergent solutions and disinfectant or by using a combination detergent or disinfectant product that accomplishes the same purpose with a thorough cleaning of the surfaces to remove excreta, feces, hair, dirt, debris and food waste so as to remove all organic and mineral buildup and to provide sanitization, followed by a clean water rinse.

(iv) Dirt, sand, gravel, grass, absorbent bedding, or other similar material must be spot cleaned daily. These surfaces must be raked or spot cleaned often enough to ensure that all animals in the enclosure can avoid contact with excreta. Contaminated material must be replaced when raking and spot cleaning are not sufficient to prevent or eliminate odors, infestations of insects, pests, or other vermin.

(3) Under no circumstances shall a dog or cat remain inside the primary enclosure or cage while it is being cleaned with live steam, sterilizing agents or agents toxic to the animal, or cleaned in a

- Page 11 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

manner likely to threaten the health and safety of the animal. Trash and waste products on the premises shall be properly contained and disposed of so as to minimize the risks of disease, contamination, and vermin.

(c) Feeding and Watering.

ε

(1) Animals shall be provided with food that is of nutritional value sufficient to maintain each animal in good health and that is free from contamination.

(2) Dogs and cats shall be adequately fed at intervals not to exceed twelve hours or at least twice in any twenty-four hour period in quantities appropriate for the animal species, age, and size, unless determined otherwise by and under the direct supervision of a duly licensed veterinarian.

(3) Sanitary food receptacles shall be provided in sufficient number, of adequate size, and located so as to enable each animal in the cage or primary enclosure to be supplied with an adequate amount of food.

(4) Animals shall be provided with constant access to clean, fresh water that is supplied in a sanitary manner and sufficient for its needs, except where there are instructions from a duly licensed veterinarian to withhold water for medical reasons.

(d) Handling. Each dog or cat shall be handled in a humane manner so as not to cause the animal physical injury, harm, or undue stress.

(e) Veterinary Care.

(1) Any Pet Seller operating pursuant to this Local Law shall designate an attending veterinarian, who shall provide veterinary care to the Pet Seller's animals which shall include a written program of veterinary care and regular visits to the Pet Seller's premises or regular visits of the animals to the attending veterinarian's office. Such program of veterinary care shall include:

- Page 12 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(i) The availability of appropriate facilities, personnel, equipment and services to comply with the provisions of the Local Law;

(ii) The use of methods determined to be appropriate by the attending veterinarian to prevent, control, and respond to diseases and injuries, and the availability of emergency, weekend, and holiday care;

(iii) Daily observation of all animals to assess their health and well-being, provided however, that daily observation of animals may be accomplished by someone other than the attending veterinarian who has received the guidance identified in subparagraph d of this paragraph; and provided, further, that a mechanism of direct and frequent communication is required so that timely and accurate information on problems of animal health, behavior and wellbeing is conveyed to the attending veterinarian;

(iv) Adequate guidance to personnel involved in the care of animals regarding handling and immobilization;

(v) Pre-procedural and post-procedural care in accordance with established veterinary medical and nursing procedures; and

(2) In the case of Dog Source Breeders who sell or offer to sell nine (9) or more dogs per year to the public that are born and raised on the Dog Source Breeder's residential premises, there shall be annual veterinary examinations, at a minimum, for all intact adult dogs or cats on such Dog Source Breeder's premises.

(3) All dogs and cats shall be inoculated as required by state or local law. Veterinary care appropriate to the species shall be provided as necessary and without undue delay. Each animal shall be observed

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

each day by the Pet Seller or by a person working under the Pet Seller's supervision.

(4) Within five (5) business days of the Pet Seller's receipt of any dog, but prior to the sale of the dog, the Pet Seller shall have a duly licensed veterinarian conduct an examination and tests appropriate to the age and breed to determine if the animal has any medical conditions apparent at the time of the examination that adversely affects its health. For animals eighteen (18) months of age or older, the examination shall include examination for any congenital conditions that adversely affect the health of the animal. Any animal diagnosed with a contagious disease shall be treated and caged separately from other animals in the isolation area required in paragraph (a) (8) of subdivision one of this section.

(5) If an animal suffers from a congenital or hereditary condition, disease or illness which, in the professional opinion of the Pet Seller's veterinarian, requires euthanasia, the veterinarian shall humanely euthanize the animal without undue delay.

(6) In the event that an animal is returned to a Pet Seller due to a congenital or hereditary condition, illness, or disease requiring veterinary care, the Pet Seller shall, without undue delay, provide the animal with proper veterinary care.

(f) Humane Euthanasia. Humane euthanasia of an animal shall be carried out only by a veterinarian duly licensed in the State of New York and in accordance with section three hundred seventy-four of the New York State Agriculture and Markets Law.

(g) Exercise Requirements. Pet Sellers shall develop, maintain, document and implement an appropriate plan to provide animals with the opportunity for daily exercise. In developing such plan, consideration should be given to providing positive physical contact with people that encourages exercise through play or other similar activities. Such written plan shall be approved by the attending veterinarian and shall be provided to the Department, or its

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

duly designated agent, annually and in accordance with any regulations it may promulgate.

(h) Fire and Carbon Monoxide Safety.

(1) All Pet Sellers' premises must be equipped with a smoke alarm that operates properly and must have a means of fire suppression, such as fire extinguishers on the premises, and be in good repair. Pet Sellers, except those who maintain dogs or cats solely on residential premises, must also have an automatic means of fire suppression, such as a sprinkler system, on the premises and it must be in good repair. The Commissioner may waive the requirement for an automatic fire suppression system upon adequate proof that it would be an undue hardship to the Pet Seller

(2) All Pet Sellers' premises must also be equipped with a carbon monoxide detector that operates properly and is, at all times, in good repair.

(i) Grooming. All dogs and cats shall be groomed regularly to prevent excessive matting of fur, overgrown toe nails and flea and tick infestation, and to maintain the health of the animal in accordance with the needs of each breed.

<u>SECTION 10.</u> PET SELLERS – CONSUMER PROTECTION REQUIREMENTS.

1. Sale of Animals: Unfit for purchase provisions.

(a) If, within fourteen (14) business days following the sale of an animal subject to this Local Law or receipt of the information statement required by subdivision two of this section, whichever occurred last, a licensed veterinarian of the Consumer's choosing certifies such animal to be unfit for purchase due to illness, congenital malformation which adversely affects the health of the animal, or the presence of symptoms of a contagious or infectious disease, or if, within one hundred-eighty (180) calendar days following such sale or receipt, whichever occurred last, a licensed

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

veterinarian of the Consumer's choosing certifies such animal to be unfit for purchase due to a congenital malformation which adversely affects the health of the animal, the Pet Seller shall afford the Consumer the right to choose one of the following options:

(1) The right to return the animal and receive a refund of the purchase price including sales tax and reasonable veterinary costs directly related to the licensed veterinarian's certification that the animal is unfit for purchase pursuant to this section;

(2) The right to return the animal and to exchange it for another animal of the Consumer's choice of the same purchase price, and reasonable veterinary costs directly related to the licensed veterinarian's certification that the first animal is unfit for purchase pursuant to this section; or

(3) The right to retain the animal and to receive reimbursement from the Pet Seller for veterinary services from a licensed veterinarian of the Consumer's choosing, for the purpose of curing or attempting to cure the animal. The reasonable value of reimbursable services rendered to cure or attempt to cure the animal shall not exceed the purchase price of the animal. The value of such services is reasonably comparable to the value of similar services rendered by other licensed veterinarians in proximity to the treating veterinarian. Such reimbursement shall not include the costs of initial veterinary examination fees and diagnostic fees not directly related to the licensed veterinarian's certification that the animal is unfit for purchase pursuant to this section.

(b) No Pet Seller shall knowingly sell an animal that has a diagnosed congenital condition or contagious disease that adversely affects the health of the animal without first informing the Consumer, in writing, of such condition.

(c) The Commissioner shall promulgate regulations that prescribe a form for and the content of, the certification that an animal is unfit for purchase, which shall be provided by an examining veterinarian to a Consumer upon

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

the examination of an animal which is subject to the provisions of this section. Such form shall include, but not be limited to: information which identifies the type of animal, the owner, the date and diagnosis of the animal, the treatment recommended, if any, and an estimate or the actual cost of such treatment. Such form shall also include the information statement prescribed by subdivision two of this section

(d) The Commissioner shall promulgate regulations that prescribe information which shall be provided in writing by the Pet Seller to the Consumer upon the sale of the animal. Such information shall include, but not be limited to: a description, including breed of the animal, the date of purchase, the name, address and telephone number of the Consumer, and the amount of the purchase. The Pet Seller shall certify such information by signing the document in which it is contained.

(e) The refund and/or reimbursement required by paragraph (a) of subdivision one of this section shall be made by the Pet Seller no later than ten (10) business days following receipt of a signed veterinary certification herein required. Such certification shall be presented to the Pet Seller no later than three business days following receipt thereof by the Consumer.

(f) Every Pet Seller who sells an animal to a Consumer that requires vaccination against rabies pursuant to Public Health Law Section 2141 shall provide the Consumer at point of sale with a written notice provided by the Department summarizing rabies immunization requirements.

(g) A veterinary finding of intestinal parasites shall not be grounds for declaring an animal unfit for sale unless the animal is clinically ill due to such condition. An animal may not be found unfit for sale on account of an injury sustained or illness contracted subsequent to the Consumer taking possession thereof.

(h) In the event that a Pet Seller wishes to contest a demand for refund, exchange, or reimbursement made by a Consumer pursuant to this section, such seller shall have the right to require the Consumer to produce the animal for examination by a licensed veterinarian designated by such Pet

- Page 17 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

Seller. Upon such examination, if the Consumer and the Pet Seller are unable to reach an agreement which constitutes one of the options set forth in paragraph (a) of subdivision one of this section within ten (10) business days following receipt of the animal for such examination, the Consumer may initiate an action in a court of competent jurisdiction to recover or obtain such refund, exchange or reimbursement.

(i) Nothing in this section shall in any way limit the rights or remedies which are otherwise available to a Consumer under any other law.

2. Information statement to Consumer.

(a) Every Pet Seller shall deliver to the Consumer at the time of sale, a written statement in a standardized form prescribed by the Commissioner containing the following information:

(1) For Cats:

(i) The breeder's and, if applicable, broker's name and address, if known, or if not known, the source of the cat. If the person from whom the cat was obtained is a dealer licensed by the United States Department of Agriculture, the person's name, address and federal identification number;

(ii) The date of the cat's birth, unless unknown because of the source of the cat, the date the Pet Seller received the cat, and the location where the cat was received;

(iii) A record of any immunizations and worming treatments administered to the cat while the cat was in the possession of the Pet Seller, as of the time of sale, including dates of administration and the types of vaccines or worming treatments administered;

(iv) A record of any known disease, sickness or congenital condition that adversely affects the health of the cat at the time of sale;

- Page 18 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(v) A record of any veterinary treatment or medication received by the cat while in the possession of the Pet Seller and either of the following:

(vi) A statement signed by the Pet Seller at the time of sale indicating that the cat has no known disease or illness and that the cat has no known congenital or hereditary condition that adversely affects the health of the cat at the time of sale; or (vii) A record of any known congenital or hereditary condition, disease or illness that adversely affects the health of the cat at the time of sale, along with a statement signed by a licensed veterinarian that authorizes the sale of the cat, recommends necessary treatment, if any, and verifies that the condition, disease or illness does not require hospitalization or non-elective surgical procedures and is not likely to require hospitalization or non-elective surgical procedures in the future. A veterinarian statement is not required for intestinal or external parasites unless their presence makes the cat clinically ill or is likely to make the cat clinically ill. The statement should be valid for fourteen (14) business days following examination of the cat by the veterinarian.

(2) For dogs:

(i) The breeder's and, if applicable, broker's name and address, if known, and if not known, the source of the dog. If the person from whom the dog was obtained is a dealer licensed by the United States Department of Agriculture, the person's name, address and federal identification number;

(ii) The date of the dog's birth and the date and location where the Pet Seller received the dog. If the dog is not advertised or sold as a purebred, registered or s capable of registration, the date of birth may be approximated if not known by the Pet Seller;

- Page 19 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(iii) The breed, sex, color and identifying marks at the time of sale. If the dog is from a United States Department of Agriculture licensed source, the individual identifying tag, tattoo or collar number for that animal. If the breed is unknown or mixed, the record shall so indicate. If the dog is being sold as being capable of registration, the names and registration numbers of the sire and dam, and the litter number, if known;

(iv) A record of any inoculations and worming treatments administered to the dog while the dog was in the possession of the Pet Seller, as of the time of sale, including dates of administration and the type of vaccines and/or worming treatments administered;

(vi) A record of any veterinary treatment or medication received by the dog while in the possession of the Pet Seller and either of the following:

(vii) A statement, signed by the Pet Seller at the time of sale indicating that the dog has no known disease or illness and that the dog has no known congenital or hereditary condition that adversely affects the health of the dog at the time of sale; or

(viii) A record of any known congenital or hereditary condition, disease or illness that adversely affects the health of the dog at the time of sale, along with a statement signed by a licensed veterinarian that authorizes the sale of the dog, recommends necessary treatment, if any, and verifies that the condition, disease, or illness does not require hospitalization or non-elective surgical procedures and is not likely to require hospitalization or non-elective surgical procedures in the future. A veterinarian statement is not required for intestinal or external parasites unless their presence makes the dog clinically ill or is likely to make the dog clinically ill. The

- Page 20 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

statement shall be valid for fourteen (14) business days following examination of the dog by the veterinarian.

(ix) Notification that dogs residing in New York State must be licensed, and that a license may be obtained from the municipality in which the Consumer resides.

(b) A disclosure made pursuant to subparagraph (1) or (2) of this section shall be signed by both the Pet Seller certifying the accuracy of the statement, and the Consumer acknowledging receipt of the statement. At the time of sale, each Pet Seller shall provide the Consumer with information, provided by the Department, on the value of spaying and neutering of dogs and cats.

(c) Every Pet Seller shall post conspicuously within close proximity to the primary enclosures of dogs and cats offered for sale, a notice containing the following language in one hundred point type:

"Information on the source of these dogs and cats and the veterinary treatment received by these dogs and cats is available for review by prospective consumers."

3. Animal Pedigree Registration.

(a) Representation regarding animal's pedigree registration: Any Pet Seller who states, promises, or represents that an animal is registered or is capable of registration with an animal pedigree registry organization shall provide the Consumer with the appropriate documents necessary for such registration within one hundred twenty (120) days following sale of the animal. If the Consumer notifies the Pet Seller in writing on or before such time that he or she has not received the appropriate registration documents, the Pet Seller shall have, in addition to the one hundred twenty days, sixty (60) more days to provide the appropriate documents.

(1) If a Pet Seller fails to provide documents as required under paragraph (a) of this section, the Consumer, upon written notice to the Pet Seller, may keep the animal and receive a partial refund of seventy-five percent of the purchase price, in which event the Pet Seller shall not be required to provide registration documents. Acceptance by the Consumer of appropriate registration documents,

- Page 21 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

whether or not within the time periods set forth in paragraph (a) of this section, shall be deemed a waiver of the right to a partial refund pursuant to this subdivision.

(b) Registration notice-disclosure statement.

(1) A Pet Seller that sells animals registered or is capable of registration with a pedigree registry shall post conspicuously within close proximity to those animals a notice that states: "Pedigree registration means that the particular registry maintains information on the parentage and identity of the animal."

(2) For every animal sold by a Pet Seller with the representation that the animal is registered or s capable of registration with an animal pedigree registry organization, the following fully completed disclosure shall be made by the Pet Seller in writing on a sheet separate from any other statement in substantially the following form:

"Disclosure of animal pedigree registration: Description of animal; The animal you are purchasing is registered/qualified to be registered (circle one) with the (enter name of registry). Registration means that (enter name of registry) maintains information regarding parentage and identity of this animal. Persons buying animals represented by a Pet Seller as being qualified to be registered are entitled to papers necessary to affect such registration within one hundred twenty (120) days of purchase. Failure to provide such papers entitles the Consumer to remedies under law. However, if the Consumer notifies the Pet Seller within the one hundred twenty (120) day period that he or she has not received such papers, the Pet Seller shall have an additional sixty (60) days commencing at the end of the one hundred twenty (120) day period in which to provide the documents. Acknowledged: Date: Consumer's Signature."

(3) The disclosure shall be signed and dated by the Consumer, acknowledging receipt of a copy of the statement. The Pet Seller shall retain a copy of the signed disclosure.

- Page 22 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

SECTION 11. RECORDS OF PURCHASE AND SALE.

1. Each Pet Seller shall keep and maintain records for each dog or cat purchased, acquired, held, sold or otherwise disposed of. The records shall include the following:

(a) The name and address of the person from whom each dog or cat was acquired. If the person from whom the animal was obtained is a dealer licensed by the United States Department of Agriculture, the person's name, address, and federal dealer identification number. If the person is a pet dealer licensed by New York State pursuant to Article 26-A of the Agriculture and Markets Law, the dealer's name, address and state dealer identification number. If the person is a Pet Seller licensed by this act, the Pet Seller's name, address and permit number. If the person is a breeder, the breeder's name, address, and, if applicable, USDA license number; and

(b) In the case of cats, if a cat is placed in the custody or possession of a Pet Seller and the source of origin is unknown, the Pet Seller shall state that the source of origin is unknown, accompanied by the date, time, and location of receipt; and

(c) The original source of the animal if different than the person recorded in subdivision one of this section; and

(d) The date each dog or cat was acquired; and

(e) A description of each animal showing age, color, markings, sex, breed, and any inoculation, worming, or other veterinary treatment or medication information available. Records shall also include any other significant identification, if known, for each animal, including official tag number, tattoo or (implant) microchip; and

(f) The name and address of the person to whom the animal is sold, given or bartered or to whom it is otherwise transferred or delivered. The records shall indicate the date and method of disposition; and

- Page 23 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(g) The Pet Seller's Ulster County permit number.

2. Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision one of this section, no Pet Seller shall knowingly buy, sell, exhibit, transport or offer for sale, exhibition or transportation, any stolen dog or cat. No Pet Seller shall knowingly sell any dog or cat younger than eight (8) weeks of age.

3. Prior to the sale, exchange, or other transfer of ownership of a dog or cat, a Pet Seller is required to examine the Ulster County Animal Abuse Registry to confirm that the potential owner is not a registered animal abuser. If a Pet Seller determines that an individual is a registered animal abuser, the Pet Seller shall not sell, exchange or otherwise transfer ownership of a dog or cat to such individual.

4. Records for each animal shall be maintained for a period of two (2) years from the date of sale or transfer, whichever occurs later. During normal business hours, the records shall be made available to persons authorized by law to enforce the provisions of this Local Law.

SECTION 12. CERTIFICATION BY DOG DEALERS AND SOURCE BREEDERS REQUIRED.

1. It shall be unlawful for any Pet Seller in Ulster County to knowingly import, offer for sale, sell or barter any dog from a Dog Source Breeder that does not comply with the standards of care enumerated in this Local Law.

2. Dog Dealers and Dog Source Breeders who supply dogs directly to Pet Sellers shall provide a written certification to such Pet Sellers that the dogs it provides to them have been obtained from Dog Source Breeders where they have been raised and maintained in compliance with this Local Law.

3. The Commissioner shall establish a written form for the certification required by this section, which will, at a minimum, include the name, legal address, contact information for the Dog Dealer if applicable, and Dog Source Breeder, along with

- Page 24 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

the requirement for a sworn statement attesting that the Dog Source Breeder is in compliance with the standards prescribed in this Local Law.

4. Pet Sellers shall provide Consumers with a copy of this certification at the point of sale and shall file the written certification required by this section with the Commissioner on a semi-annual basis and in accordance with any rules promulgated by the Commissioner.

SECTION 13. DOG SOURCE BREEDERS: MINIMUM STANDARDS OF CARE.

1. Food and Water.

(a) All dogs must be provided with adequate food that is clean and free from contaminants at intervals not to exceed twelve hours or at least twice in any twenty-four (24) hour period unless directed otherwise by a duly licensed veterinarian.

(b) All dogs must be provided with potable water at all times, unless directed otherwise in writing by a duly licensed veterinarian. Such special instructions concerning food or water shall be kept in the Dog Source Breeder's records for the dog.

2. Housing.

(a) Except where dogs are permitted to roam freely inside the Dog Source Breeder's residential premises, dogs shall be kept in primary enclosures that are designed and constructed to be structurally sound and that are kept in good repair.

(b) Primary enclosures for dogs shall:

(1) Have no sharp points or edges that could injure dogs;

(2) Be maintained in a manner to protect dogs from injury;

(3) If not fully enclosed on the top, be of a height sufficient to prevent the dog from climbing over the walls of the enclosure;

- Page 25 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(4) Keep animals from entering the enclosure;

(5) Enable dogs to remain dry and clean;

(6) Provide shelter and protection from temperatures and weather conditions that may be uncomfortable or hazardous to any dog;

(7) Provide sufficient space to shelter all dogs housed in the primary enclosure at one time;

(8) Provide potable water at all times, unless otherwise directed by a veterinarian in writing that shall be kept in the Dog Source Breeder's records;

(9) Enable all surfaces in contact with dogs to be readily cleaned and sanitized in compliance with paragraph (d) of subdivision 4 of this section.

3. Space.

(a) Primary enclosures shall provide enough space to allow each dog to turn about freely and to stand, sit, and lie in a normal position. All dogs in the enclosure must be able to lie down while fully extended without the dog's head, legs, face or feet touching any side of the enclosure or another dog. The interior height of a primary enclosure shall be at least six (6) inches higher than the head of the tallest dog in the enclosure when it is in a normal standing position.

(b) All dogs over twelve (12) weeks of age housed in primary enclosures must be provided with a minimum amount of floor space in the primary enclosure, calculated as follows: Find the mathematical square of the sum of the length of dog in inches, measured in a straight line from the tip of its nose to the base of its tail plus six inches, then divide the product by 144, then multiply by two. The calculation is: (length of dog in inches +6) equals required floor space in square inches. Required floor space in inches/144 x 2 = required floor space in square feet. For a second dog placed in the primary enclosure the minimum floor space shall be doubled. The floor space shall be calculated using the longest dog. For each dog

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

above two, the minimum floor space shall be multiplied by 1.5 per additional dog.

(c) For dogs over twelve (12) weeks of age, primary enclosures must be placed no higher than thirty (30) inches above the floor of the housing facility and may not be placed over or stacked on top of another cage or primary enclosure

(d) For dogs twelve (12) weeks of age or younger, primary enclosures shall not be stacked more than two (2) rows high, and the bottom of the uppermost primary enclosure may not be more than four and one-half (4 $\frac{1}{2}$) feet off the housing facility floor. Where the primary enclosures are stacked, a tray or other device that will prevent urine, feces, and other debris from passing into or being discharged into the underlying primary enclosure shall be placed under the primary enclosure. The trap or other device must be impermeable to water and capable of being easily sanitized.

(e) All housing facilities shall be equipped with a smoke alarm and shall have a means of fire suppression, such as fire extinguishers or a sprinkler system on premises.

4. Sanitation.

(a) Excreta, feces, hair, dirt, debris and food waste must be removed from primary enclosures at least daily or more often if necessary, to prevent an accumulation of excreta, feces, hair, dirt, debris and food waste to prevent soiling of dogs contained in the primary enclosures and to reduce the risk of disease, insects, pests and odors.

(b) Used primary enclosures and food and water receptacles for dogs must be cleaned and sanitized in accordance with paragraph (d) of this section before they can be used to house, feed or water another dog or group of dogs.

(c) Used primary enclosures and food and water receptacles must be sanitized at least once every two weeks using one of the methods prescribed in paragraph (d) of this section and more often if necessary to prevent an

- Page 27 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

accumulation of excreta, feces, hair, dirt, debris, food, waste and other disease hazards.

(d) Hard surfaces of primary enclosures and food and water receptacles must be sanitized using one of the following methods:

(1) Live steam under pressure,

(2) Washing with water with a temperature of at least 180 degrees Fahrenheit and with soap or detergent, as with a mechanical cage washer; or

(3) Washing all soiled surfaces with appropriate detergent solutions and disinfectant or by using a combination detergent or disinfection product that accomplishes the same purpose with a thorough cleaning of the surfaces to remove excreta, feces, hair, dirt, debris and food waste so as to remove all organic material and mineral buildup and to provide sanitization followed by a clean water rinse.

(e) All dogs must be removed from the primary enclosure when it is being sanitized in accordance with the provisions of this subdivision.

(f) Primary enclosures, exercise areas and housing facilities using material that cannot be sanitized using methods delineated in paragraph (d) of this section must be made sanitary by removing contaminated material as necessary to prevent odors, diseases, pests, insects and vermin infestation.

(g) Premises where primary enclosures are located, including buildings and surrounding grounds, must be kept clean and in good repair to protect dogs from injury, to facilitate healthy husbandry practices, and to reduce or eliminate breeding and living areas for rodents and other pests and vermin. Premises must be kept free of accumulations of trash, junk, waste products and discarded matter. Weeds, grass and bushes must be controlled so as to facilitate cleaning of the premises and pest control and to protect the health and well-being of the dogs.

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(h) An effective program for the control of insects or pests, and external parasites affecting dogs must be established and maintained so as to promote the health and well-being of the dogs and reduce contamination by pests in housing facilities.

(i) The floors and walls of primary enclosures must be impervious to moisture. The ceiling of indoor housing facilities must be impervious to moisture or be replaceable. "Impervious surfaces" may include concrete, tiles, wood that is sealed and other materials that do not permit absorption of fluids, allow thorough and repeated cleaning and disinfection without deteriorating or retaining odors, and do not violate any other provision contained within this Section.

5. Flooring.

(a) Flooring in all primary enclosures must be constructed in a manner that protects the dogs' feet and legs from injury. The floor must not permit any part of the foot of a dog housed in the enclosure to pass through any opening.

(b) For dogs over twelve (12) weeks of age, the floor of the primary enclosure must be strong enough so that it does not sag or bend between structural supports and so that it cannot be destroyed through digging or chewing by the dogs housed in the primary enclosure. The floor shall not permit the feet of any dog housed in the primary enclosure to pass through any opening and shall not be made of metal strand, either coated or uncoated. It must allow for moderate drainage of fluids and it must not be sloped more than 0.25 inches per foot.

(c) Flooring constructed of slats shall be acceptable provided that all of the following conditions are met:

(1) The flooring is flat;

(2) Spaces between slats run the length or width of the floor, but not both;

(3) Slats are no less than 3.5 inches in width;

- Page 29 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(4) The floor has spaces between the slats that are no more than 0.5 inch in width; and

(5) Each slat is level with the slat next to it within a single primary enclosure.

6. Co-housing/ Bitches in Heat/Nursing puppies.

(a) All dogs housed in the same primary enclosure must be compatible as determined by observation. Not more than six (6) adult dogs may be housed in the same primary enclosure. Bitches in heat may not be housed in the same primary enclosure with sexually mature males, except for breeding. Bitches with litters may not be housed in the same primary enclosure with other adult dogs, and puppies under twelve weeks of age may not be housed in the same primary enclosure with adult dogs, other than the dam or foster dam. Dogs displaying vicious or aggressive behavior toward other dogs must be housed separately.

(b) Each bitch with nursing puppies shall be provided with an additional amount of floor space based on her breed and behavioral characteristics and in accordance with generally accepted husbandry practices as determined by the attending veterinarian. If the additional amount of floor space for each nursing puppy is less than five (5) percent of the minimum requirement for the bitch, the amount of floor space must be approved by the attending veterinarian and shall be kept in the Dog Source Breeder's records.

7. Ventilation and Lighting.

(a) Housing facilities for dogs must be sufficiently heated and cooled to protect dogs from temperature or humidity extremes and to provide for their health and well-being. If dogs are present, the ambient temperature in the facility must not fall below 50 degrees Fahrenheit or rise above 85 degrees Fahrenheit.

(b) Housing facilities for dogs must be sufficiently ventilated at all times when dogs are present to provide for their health and well-being and to

- Page 30 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

minimize odors, drafts, ammonia levels and to prevent moisture condensation. The relative humidity must be maintained at a level that ensures the health and well-being of the dogs housed therein.

(c) Housing facilities for dogs must be lighted well enough to permit routine inspection and cleaning of the facility and observation of the dogs. Animal areas must be provided with a regular diurnal light cycle of either natural or artificial light. Lighting must be uniformly diffused throughout housing facilities and provide sufficient illumination to aid in maintaining good housekeeping practices, adequate cleaning and observation of animals at any time and for the well-being of the animals. Primary enclosures must be placed so as to protect dogs from excessive light.

8. Veterinary Care and Records.

(a) The Dog Source Breeder shall establish a veterinarian/client-patient relationship.

(b) The Dog Source Breeder shall establish a written program of veterinary care which shall include a physical examination and vaccination schedule; a protocol for disease control and prevention; pest and parasite control; nutrition and euthanasia. A copy of the program shall be kept in the Dog Source Breeder's records.

(c) Dogs shall be examined by a veterinarian at least once every six (6) months.

(d) For each dog harbored by a Dog Source Breeder, a permanent record shall be kept and shall contain all of the following information:

(1) The date of birth of the dog;

(2) The date of the last rabies vaccination of the dog; and

(3) The date of the dog's last veterinary check.

(e) The Dog Source Breeder shall keep all veterinary records for two (2) years after the dog has left the care of the facility.

- Page 31 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(f) Notwithstanding any law, a dog may not be euthanized except by a licensed veterinarian.

9. Exercise (for dogs over twelve (12) weeks of age).

(a) Each primary enclosure housing a dog over twelve (12) weeks of age shall have an entryway that allows the dog unfettered clearance from the enclosure into an outdoor exercise area.

(b) The exercise area must be at least twice the size of each dog's primary enclosure and must have adequate means to prevent dogs from escaping.

(c) Exercise area fencing must be in good repair and be free of rust, jagged edges or other defects that could cause injury to the dogs.

(d) The exercise area must be cleaned in accordance with paragraph (f) of subdivision four of this section.

(e) Dogs must not be placed in the exercise area in a manner that would cause injury to the dog.

(f) Nursing bitches and their puppies shall be exercised separately from other dogs.

(g) The exercise area shall be on ground level and the ground of the area must be solid and maintainable. Surfaces such as gravel, packed earth and grass which are solid and maintainable may be utilized.

(h) Forced exercise methods or devices such as swimming, treadmills or carousel type devices shall not meet the exercise requirements of this paragraph and are prohibited.

(i) If, in the opinion of a licensed veterinarian, it is inappropriate for a dog to exercise because of its health, condition or well-being, this section shall not apply to that dog. Such a determination must, however, be documented

- Page 32 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

in writing by the veterinarian and shall be revisited by the attending veterinarian at least once every thirty (30) days.

SECTION 14. RESIDENTIAL BREEDERS.

1. Residential Breeder Minimum Standards of Care.

(a) Animals shall be provided, except when there are instructions from a duly licensed veterinarian to withhold food for medical reasons, with wholesome and palatable food, free from contamination and of nutritional value sufficient to maintain each animal in good health.

(b) Water shall be supplied to animals in a sanitary manner sufficient for each animal's needs, except when there are instructions from a duly licensed veterinarian to withhold water for medical reasons.

(c) In the event that a residential breeder has a pregnant or nursing dog on his or her premises, the residential breeder shall provide a whelping area or box for such dog.

(d) All animals shall be vaccinated as required by state or local law. Veterinary care appropriate to the breed shall be provided without undue delay when necessary. Each animal shall be observed each day by the residential breeder or by a person working under the residential breeder's supervision.

(e) No residential breeder shall knowingly sell any animal that has a diagnosed congenital condition or contagious disease that adversely affects the health of the animal without first informing the consumer, in writing, of such condition.

2. Records of sale by Residential Breeders.

(a) Each Residential Breeder shall keep and maintain records for each animal sold. The records shall include the name and address of the person to whom any animal is sold and the date of sale.

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

(b) Records of sale for each animal shall be maintained for a period of two years from the date of sale.

3. Inspection of Residential Breeders. Inspections of Residential Breeders shall be made whenever in the discretion of the Commissioner or his or her authorized agents, or a complaint warrants such investigation. Any person conducting an inspection of a Residential Breeder or responding to a complaint concerning a Residential Breeder shall be a either a County employee official, a police officer, or a peace officer specifically trained in the proper care of animals and in the investigation and identification of cruelty to animals.

SECTION 15. NOTICE TO CONSUMERS.

1. Every Pet Seller or Residential Breeder who sells an animal to a Consumer shall post a notice clearly visible to the Consumer and provide the Consumer at the time of sale with a written notice, printed or typed, setting forth the rights provided under this Local Law. Such notices shall be prescribed by the Commissioner, but the written notice may be contained in a written contract, an animal history certificate, or separate document, provided such notices are in ten-point boldface type.

2. No Pet Seller or Residential Breeder shall restrict or diminish by contract or otherwise, the rights provided under this Local Law.

SECTION 16. VIOLATIONS.

1. Violation of any provision of this Local Law is a civil offense for which a fine of not less than \$150.00 and not more than \$500.00 for each violation may be imposed.

2. In addition to the penalties enumerated in this section, whenever there is a violation of the provisions of Sections 10 (Pet Seller's – Consumer Protection Requirements), Section 11 (Records of Purchase and Sale) of this Local Law application may be made by the Commissioner or his designee to issue an

- Page 34 -

Proposed Local Law Number 14 Of 2016

County Of Ulster

A Local Law of the County of Ulster for the Regulation of Pet Sellers

injunction, and upon notice to the defendant of not less than five days, to enjoin and restrain the continuance of such violations; and if it shall appear to the satisfaction of the court or justice that the defendant has, in fact, violated these provisions, an injunction may be issued by such court or justice, enjoining and restraining any further violation, without requiring proof that any person has, in fact, been Injured or damaged thereby. In such a proceeding, the court may make allowances to the Commissioner as provided in Civil Practice Law and Rules Section 8303 (a) (6) and direct restitution.

SECTION 17. CONSTRUCTION WITH OTHER LAWS.

Nothing in this Local Law shall be construed to limit or restrict the police, agents, or officers of Societies for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals from enforcing Article Twenty-Six of the Agriculture and Markets Law or any other law relating to the humane treatment of or cruelty to animals.

SECTION 18. SEVERABILITY.

If any clause, sentence, paragraph, section, subdivision or other part of this Local Law or its applications shall be adjudged by a Court of competent jurisdiction to be invalid or unconstitutional, such order or judgment shall not affect, impair, or otherwise invalidate the remainder of this Local Law which shall remain in full force and effect except as limited by such order or judgment.

SECTION 19. EFFECTIVE DATE.

This Local Law shall be effective ninety (90) days after its filing in the Office of the Secretary of State and shall apply to all transactions occurring on or after the effective date of this Local Law.

Condemning Violence And Hate Speech And Expressing Solidarity With All Those Targeted For Their Ethnicity, Race, Religion, Gender, Gender Identification, Or Political Views

Referred to: The Laws and Rules, Governmental Services Committee (Chairman Roberts and Legislators Belfiglio, Donaldson, R. Parete and Rodriguez)

Legislator Jennifer Schwartz Berky and Legislators Allen, Bartels, Delaune, Donaldson, Greene, Heppner, Loughran, J. Parete and Rodriguez offer the following:

WHEREAS the United States was founded by immigrants, many fleeing religious persecution, who enshrined freedom of religion as one of our nation's fundamental legal and ethical principles; and

WHEREAS we are deeply saddened and outraged at the recent escalation of hateful rhetoric against immigrants, all people of color, ethnicity, race, religion, gender, gender identification, and political views; and

WHEREAS we, as elected representatives of the people, have a special responsibility not to stay silent in the face of hate violence and discrimination against any of our constituents or countrymen; now, therefore be it

RESOLVED, the Ulster County Legislature condemns all hateful speech and violent action directed at any individual or group based on ethnicity, race, religion, gender, gender identification, or political views; and, be it further

RESOLVED, the Ulster County Legislature commits to pursuing a policy agenda that affirms civil and human rights, and ensures that those targeted on the basis of ethnicity, race, religion, gender, gender identification, political views or immigration status can turn to government without fear of recrimination, and, be it further

RESOLVED, the Ulster County Legislature reaffirms the value of a pluralistic society, the beauty of a culture composed of multiple cultures, and the inalienable right of every person to live and practice their faith without fear,

and moves its adoption.

ADOPTED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

AYES: NOES:

Postponed in Committee: Laws and Rules, Governmental Services on October 18, 2016

Passed Committee: Laws and Rules, Governmental Services as amended on

SIGN IN SHEET

Laws & Rules, Governmental Services Committee Date: <u>November 21, 2016</u>

Committee Members: Kevin A. Roberts, Chairman David B. Donaldson, Deputy Chairman Carl Belfiglio Richard A. Parete Hector S. Rodriguez Other:

Ken J. Ronk, Jr., Legislative Chair
Erica Guerin, Legislative Counsel
Nicholas Pascale, Legislative Counsel
Chris Ragucci, Minority Counsel
Jay Mahler, Deputy Clerk

Guests:

NAME (Please Print)	DEPARTMENT OR ORGANIZATION
Dossaine Whitney	UC Insurance Dept.
Tom Kadgen	LWV
Vic Melville	LWV
Evan Gallo	UC Compteoller's Office
Tom and Beverly Delaney	Shawangunk Kennel Club
Chris Allen	UC Legislature
Jennifer Schwortz Berky	UC Legislature
	/
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	