

**Energy, Environment & Sustainability Committee
Meeting Minutes**

DATE & TIME: February 3, 2022; 6:30 PM or immediately following the Law Enforcement & Public Safety Committee
LOCATION: Powered by Zoom Meeting Meeting ID: 83744897489
By Phone Dial (646) 558-8656,
PRESIDING OFFICER: Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene
LEGISLATIVE STAFF: Fawn A. Tantillo
PRESENT: Legislators Gina Hansut, Phil Erner, Joseph Maloney. Eric Stewart
ABSENT: None
QUORUM PRESENT: Yes

OTHER ATTENDEES: Legislator Laura Petit; Deputy Executive Marc Rider; Emily Hauser, Ulster County Environmental Management Council (EMC); Nick Hvozda, Interim Director of Department of Environment; Dr. Katherine Beinkafner, Charles Landi and Charles Whittaker, Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency (UCRRA); Rebecca Martin, Shannon Harris and Jen Benson, Riverkeeper; Tanya Garmet.

Chairwoman Greene called the meeting to order at approximately 6:30 PM, made introductions, lead the Pledge of Allegiance and read the mission of the committee.

Motion No. 1: **Motion to APPROVE the Minutes of November 29, 2021**

Motion Made By: Legislator Greene
Motion Seconded By: Legislator Maloney

Discussion: (See transcript)

Voting in Favor: Legislators Greene, Hansut, Erner, Maloney, and Stewart

Voting Against: None

No. of Votes in Favor: 5

No. of Votes Against: 0

Disposition: **Minutes APPROVED**

Dr. Katherine Beinkafner, Charles Landi and Charles Whittaker gave an overview of the UCRRA that included a report of their solid waste diversion efforts. The committee discussed the need for more diversion, progress on the study of potential landfill siting, and other solid waste issues.

Interim Director of the Department of Environment Nick Hvozda gave an overview of that county department and various environmental projects throughout Ulster County that included and Arbor Day application for municipal tree planting projects, grants for weatherization and lighting upgrades to county buildings, Climate Smart Communities action plans, rooftop solar installation on the UCAT garage, expanding the electric vehicle (EV) charging stations for the public and the Ulster County fleet and developing a reuse innovation center.

Resolution No. 10: Confirming The Appointments To The Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency

Resolution Summary: This resolution would two members to be determined to the UCRRA Board.

Disposition: NO ACTION TAKEN

The committee scheduled a SPECIAL MEETING to conduct interviews and consider Resolution No. 10 on Wednesday, February 9 at 3:30.

Resolution No. 15: Setting A Public Hearing On Proposed Local Law No. 1 Of 2022, A Local Law Amending The Code Of The County Of Ulster, Chapter 131, Vehicles, County, Article I, Sustainable Green Fleet Policy, In Relation To Strategies And Goals, To Be Held On Tuesday, March 15, 2022 At 7:00 PM

Resolution Summary: This resolution schedules a date and time for a public hearing on a proposed local law to update the Ulster County Green Fleet Policy.

Motion No. 2: Moved Resolution No. 15 FOR DISCUSSION

Motion Made By: Legislator Hansut

Motion Seconded By: Legislator Maloney

Discussion: See Transcript

Motion No. 3: Motion to POSTPONE Resolution No. 15

Motion Made By: Legislator Maloney

Motion Seconded By: Legislator Erner

Discussion: See Transcript

Voting in Favor: Legislators Greene, Hansut, Erner, Maloney, and Stewart

Voting Against: None

No. of Votes in Favor: 5

No. of Votes Against: 0

Disposition: Resolution POSTPONED

Resolution No. 18: Appointing An Independent Administrative Hearing Officer Pursuant To §304-25 Of The Code Of The County Of Ulster

Resolution Summary: This resolution will appoint an Independent Hearing Officer to be determined as authorized in Local Law 8 of 1991 “Ulster County Mandatory Source Separation And Recycling Law”

Motion No. 4: Moved Resolution No. 18 FOR DISCUSSION

Motion Made By: Legislator Maloney

Motion Seconded By: Legislator Erner

Discussion: See Transcript

Motion No. 5: Motion to POSTPONE Resolution No. 18

Motion Made By: Legislator Maloney

Motion Seconded By: Legislator Stewart
Discussion: See Transcript
Voting in Favor: Legislators Greene, Hansut, Erner, Maloney, and Stewart
Voting Against: None
No. of Votes in Favor: 5
No. of Votes Against: 0
Disposition: **Resolution POSTPONED**

Resolution No. 19: Appointing And Reappointing Members To The Recycling Oversight Committee

Resolution Summary: This resolution will appoint and reappoint individuals representing various stakeholders to the Recycling Oversight Committee.

Motion No. 6: **Moved Resolution No. 19 FOR DISCUSSION**
Motion Made By: Legislator Erner
Motion Seconded By: Legislator Stewart
Discussion: See Transcript
Voting in Favor: Legislators Greene, Hansut, Erner, Maloney, and Stewart
Voting Against: None
No. of Votes in Favor: 5
No. of Votes Against: 0
Disposition: **Resolution ADOPTED**

Resolution No. 23: Confirming The Appointment Of Nick Hvozda As Director Of The Department Of Environment

Resolution Summary: This resolution confirms the County Executive’s appointment of Nick Hvozda as Director of the Department of Environment

Motion No. 7: **Moved Resolution No. 23 FOR DISCUSSION**
Motion Made By: Legislator Hansut
Motion Seconded By: Legislator Erner
Discussion: See Transcript
Voting in Favor: Legislators Greene, Hansut, Erner, Maloney, and Stewart
Voting Against: None
No. of Votes in Favor: 5
No. of Votes Against: 0
Disposition: **Resolution ADOPTED**

Environmental Consideration Checklist

Chairwoman Greene explained that Environmental Consideration Checklists (ECC) were being forwarded to her as Chair of this committee per the policy in Resolution No. 588 of 2021. It is her responsibility to review these

ECCs to ensure all appropriate environmental policies are considered before resolutions for capital project come before the legislature for consideration because most of these capital projects will not come before the Environmental committee. When capital projects come before the Public Works committee these ECCs should also be attached as backup.

Champlain Hudson Power Express

Rebecca Martin of Riverkeeper and Shannon Harris, Supervisor of the Town of Esopus gave a presentation regarding concerns about the Champlain Hudson Power Express (CHPE) plans to install a transmission cable along and in the Hudson River. Harris is also a representative of the 7 Hudson River municipalities that draw drinking water from the Hudson River that are threatened by this project. In addition to serious environmental concerns, they oppose the request of a 30-year PILOT (Payment in lieu of taxes) request by the project developers.

Legislator Erner volunteered to prepare a memorializing letter or resolution to oppose the CHPE PILOT and outline environmental concerns.

Ulster County Environmental Management Committee (EMC)

Emily Hauser of the EMC introduced herself and explained the mission of the EMC. She invited Legislators and the public to attend the EMC meetings on the last Wednesday of the month at 6:30.

New Business

Old Business

Chairwoman Greene asked if there was any other business, hearing none;

Motion to Adjourn

Motion Made By: Legislator Maloney
Motion Seconded By: Legislator Erner
No. of Votes in Favor: 5
No. of Votes Against: 0
Time: 9:18 PM

Respectfully submitted by: Fawn Tantillo
Minutes Approved: March 3, 2022

**Energy, Environment & Sustainability Committee
Meeting Transcript**

DATE & TIME: February 3, 2022; 6:30 PM or immediately following the Law Enforcement & Public Safety Committee
LOCATION: Powered by Zoom Meetings, Meeting ID: 83744897489
By Phone Dial (646) 558-8656,
PRESIDING OFFICER: Chair Manna Jo Greene
LEGISLATIVE STAFF: Fawn A. Tantillo
PRESENT: Legislators Gina Hansut, Phil Erner, Joseph Maloney. Eric Stewart
ABSENT: None
QUORUM PRESENT: Yes

OTHER ATTENDEES: Legislator Laura Petit; Deputy Executive Marc Rider; Emily Hauser, Ulster County Environmental Management Council (EMC); Nick Hvozda, Interim Director of Department of Environment; Dr. Katherine Beinkafner, Charles Landi and Charles Whittaker, Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency (UCRRA); Rebecca Martin, Shannon Harris and Jen Benson, Riverkeeper; Tanya Garnet.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

I would like to call the February 3, 2022 Environment and Sustainability, rather Energy, Environment and Sustainability Committee meeting to order and this is a virtual meeting. And would the clerk kindly call the roll?

Fawn Tantillo

Yes, ma'am. Chair Manna Jo Greene?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Present.

Fawn Tantillo

Deputy Chair Gina Hansut?

Legislator Gina Hansut

Present.

Fawn Tantillo

Phil Erner?

Legislator Erner

Present.

Fawn Tantillo

Joseph Maloney?

Legislator Joseph Maloney

Here.

Fawn Tantillo

And Eric Stewart?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Not yet.

Fawn Tantillo

One moment, I see a caller at 5859437454. May I get your name?

Jen Benson

Jen Benson with Riverkeeper. I live on Hasbrouck Avenue in Kingston.

Fawn Tantillo

Okay. Thank you, Jen. All right.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

All right. So, in a sense, the rest of the people on the call got to briefly meet the legislators during roll call. But I'm just going to go across the squares and starting with our very kind clerk, Fawn Tantillo. Just say whatever.

Fawn Tantillo

I'm the clerk that's been emailing you and, and I'm happy if you need anything. Give me a, drop me a line.

Legislator Eric Stewart

Okay, folks, sorry about that.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yay.

Fawn Tantillo

Oh, that's Eric down there. Okay.

Legislator Eric Stewart

Yes.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Just to note that Eric Stewart has joined us and is present and visible. Charlie Landi, and followed by Marc Rider. Just say who you are and you know, kind of create a context particularly for our new legislators.

Charles Landi

Charlie Landi, the Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency, Board Treasurer, on anything, I can answer any questions that I can answer about the RRA.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Thank you.

Deputy Executive Rider

Hi, everybody, Marc, Marc Rider, Deputy County Executive. I'm in this meeting because I, one of the departments in my portfolio is a, the Environment, Department of the Environment. I'm also overseeing the Green New Deal as one of the initiatives that has come into my portfolio as of late when Evelyn Wright left. So, working with you all on a new committee, many of you know me, but it's, it's good to see you.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Right. Up until this meeting, this committee was the Energy and Environment Committee. And it's now Energy, Environment and Sustainability and I'm thrilled. But it's also a mouthful. So, we're calling it EES. Gina, do you want to say a word followed by Joe?

Legislator Gina Hansut

Sure. I'm Gina Hansen. I'm a newly-elected legislator from District 10, which makes up part of the town of Lloyd in the northern part of Marlborough. And I just finished with my Law Enforcement and Public Safety committee meeting and hopped on here now, and I look forward to working with all of you and meeting you.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

You're doing double duty. Thank you. Joe followed by Nick.

Legislator Maloney

Joe Maloney, District Two Saugerties.

Nick Hvozda

Hi, everybody. I'm Nick Hvozda. I'm the Interim Director for the Department of the Environment, and previous Deputy Director.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And then Phil, followed by Emily.

Legislator Erner

District 6, city of Kingston, wards 3, 5, and 9.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Emily followed by.

Emilie Hauser

Emilie Hauser, I'm a resident of the city of Kingston, and I'm here as vice chair of the Ulster County Environmental Management Council.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Great, and the reason I say 'followed by' is so you can know to take yourself off mute and then when you're done talking, put yourself back on mute. So, Charlie Whittaker followed by Legislator Petit. Charlie is the operations manager for the Ulster County UCRRA. Laura?

Legislator Petit

Hi, I'm Laura Petit. I represent District 8, Esopus.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And let's see Kathy, followed by Rebecca Martin, I guess. Kathy, please?

Katherine Beinkafner

Again, can you hear me now?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yes.

Katherine Beinkafner

Okay, good. Oh, it is so good to see everyone. Hey, this is great. Um, I am the chairperson of the board for the Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency. And that's what I do. Who's next?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Right, um, let's see. Rebecca Martin, followed by Legislator Stewart.

Rebecca Martin

Hi, Rebecca Martin here tonight, Director of Community Partnerships from Riverkeeper.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Eric?

Legislator Eric Stewart

And I'm Eric Stewart. I represent District 18, which is portions of the town of Hurley and portions of the town of Marbletown. Previously, I served on board in Marbletown for the last four years. And I've had the pleasure of working with them a lot of you already, so it's nice seeing everyone, and I look forward to working with you all more.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, Charlie Whittaker. Do you want to take yourself off mute or? I did kind of introduce you. There you go.

Charlie Whittaker

Can you hear me?

Fawn Tantillo

Now we can, yes.

Charlie Whittaker

What I would like to touch on, how are you doing, everybody? Catherine, how are you? Charlie, how you doing? I'd like to talk about what we've done in the past year.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

We will have a chance to have you speak because it's on the agenda. I was just doing introductions. We haven't even done the pledge to the flag yet.

Charlie Whittaker

I thought you introduced me before. I thought you introduced me before.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, sorry for the confusion. And Jen Benson is also from Riverkeeper. And will have a chance to speak later on a specific topic. Have I missed anybody? Okay, so I want to go back and I've called the meeting to order. And I'd like to ask is there a volunteer to lead the Pledge of Allegiance? If not, we're gonna call on somebody. Okay. Thank you, Laura.

Legislator Petit

I pledge allegiance to the flag of the United States of America and to the republic for which it stands, one nation under God, indivisible, with liberty and justice for all.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

The next item is to approve the minutes of the previous meeting which was, minutes and transcript, November 29, 2021. That was a case where Energy and Environment met the last week of the preceding month. It's, so it's not really the November minutes, it's the December meeting minutes but every once in a while, we'll meet on a fifth, in this case, Thursday, instead of the first Thursday, you know. Anyway, so you do not have had to attend that meeting. I think this is pretty much an all new committee. Um, and in order to approve the minutes, I think it's unusual for the chair to make a motion, but since I was the only person that was there, I would like to make a motion to approve the minutes, do I hear a second?

Legislator Maloney

Second.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, that was Joe. Okay, all in favor, please signify by raising your hand and/or saying aye, either one works. If you're on mute, you can just raise your hand.

Fawn Tantillo

To be clear, Madam Chair, we need to see and hear people when they vote. So, it's good that they raise their hand, but they need to also say aye.

Committee Members

Aye.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

All right. Okay. Does anybody object? All right, motion carries. The minutes are approved. And before we go into the UCRRA update, and at that time, you know, Charlie, and anyone else from the agency is welcome to speak. I want to start by just reminding us, beginning of a new year, a new session. And a new name for the committee. As I mentioned, I want to just read our mission to help get us focused. And that is, the mission of the Standing Committee on Energy, Environment and Sustainability is to set up policy and review contracts pertaining to the Department of Environment, the Environmental Management Council, Fish and Wildlife Management Board and Forest Practice Board, including the protection of waterways, and the county's recycling efforts, to set policy and review contracts pertaining to, but not limited to the activities of the Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency. So, just so we're clear, and I would also, Fawn, I think it's been a while since we've heard from Forest Practice Board, and I wonder if we could specially reach out to them for March just to reconnect since they are supposed to report.

Fawn Tantillo

Madam Chair, I do not believe, it says New York State Forest Practice Board in the research I've done recently, I do not believe that committee exists any longer.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Oh, well, we may want to modify this, especially before the directory goes to print.

Fawn Tantillo

Well, it would take a resolution, so, they were thinking they would probably just correct it next year, but.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay. That's fine with me. Any committee member have a concern about that? So, with that, to go back to the agenda. The first report of the evening is from the UCRRA. Is Tim here? If not, whoever is going to report for the UCRRA, please proceed.

Charlie Whittaker

That would be me. Are we okay, ready? Can everybody hear me? Can you hear me?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yes.

Charlie Whittaker

Yeah. Charlie, can you hear me?

Charles Landi

Yes.

Charlie Whittaker

Okay. Okay, everybody can hear me then. So, um, what I want to talk about right now is I want to talk a bit about last year. We did close to 150,000 tons in our trash building. And I always talk, I always talk to the people working

on my buildings that we are recovery place first, not a disposal place, but a recovery place. So, our mission is to capture as much as we possibly can from the waste stream and prevent it from going to a landfill, saving on trailers, fuel, and also landfill space. I put together some numbers before I came here on just what we recovered from the trash. So, 195 batteries, 3800 deterrents, you know, people without tarps, stuff blowing all over the place. 38 worn, 93, almost 94 tons of clean wood, 676 tons of rubble concrete. This is all out of my garbage belt, this is what we capture. We got two spotters on the floor. So, these are pretty staggering numbers considering the, the people we got working on the floor. We're always. 86 tons of cardboard containers, that people put stuff in that they're going to throw away. Our guys see and capture, and the cardboard, 86 tons. Just so you folks know, 53 tractor trailer, 53-foot tractor trailer, we send out 20 tons, so, you're looking at almost 5 tractor trailer loads of cardboard. Okay, these are just boxes, dumping them out, capturing the cardboard, five tractor trailers. 1100 propane tanks, 3900, almost 4000 tires, 5200 pounds of wire, 2000 pounds of copper, 150 balances, 553 tons of metal. I'll say that again. 553 tons of metal. 380 tons of brush and clean wood, Freon, 2510, Freon units, air conditioners, dehumidifiers, and 77 tons of E-waste. Now the E-waste is not the collection point at the office every Saturday. This is out of our building, e-waste capture.

So, this is what the folks are doing inside these trash buildings. Pulling out from the trash, 157, 150, almost 150,000 tons of trash. The markets are still decent. They're not great like they were three months ago, but they're decent. The natural, your number two natural and number two color, they're about where they should be, normal. Your PET is about double of what it usually, it's usually 11 to 15 cents a pound. So, and the metals are still doing okay, not great. But okay. Currently we're having trouble getting Ellen baling wire, just like everybody else is, eleven-gauge baling wire for our, for our bales. That's been an issue. And I want to say these numbers, everything that I just told you is outside of what our MRF has failed and spilled. So, just to give you an update on what we're doing inside the building. At our recycling center, 1500 tons of co-mingle, 300, was it, 587 tons of glass, 1155 tons of mixed news, 1100 tons of the city of Kingston, the city's hard mixed, next, 20, or 2600 tons of OCC, 878 tons of brush, that, and that's for our compost, 33, almost 3400 tons of food waste. And 179 tons of E-waste collected at the office every Saturday. So, and we did 2100 tons of wood chips from the towns.

So, that gives you an idea of what's going on. At our MRF, what we're doing there with the folks there, I got about five people on the firmer, so when you look at this stuff, all this stuff being baled, sorted, inspected, that's all at our MRF, this is all inside of our trash building. So, this is what we do. This is our focus, no matter how the markets are doing. If the markets are doing bad, if the numbers are negative, the agency always picks that up and does not pass that along to the towns. We have not, since I've been in charge, passed on any of these costs when they go into a negative, to the towns, such as glass. Anybody got any questions?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Go ahead, Legislator Maloney.

Legislator Maloney

Okay, I wasn't sure. You um, what do you do with the batteries? I got a couple of questions that I've always wondered about. And I think it's good if we start asking more questions rather than be embarrassed we don't know something.

Charlie Whittaker

Sure. So, batteries are recovered and sent to the scrapyard. I want to mention that number again. 195 batteries pulled out of the trash, out of 150,000 tons. Just imagine, and finding 195 batteries. That's incredible. So, 195 batteries, they go to the scrapyard.

Legislator Maloney

Do you find, if there's things, electronics, brush, things that supposed to be getting mixed in, if you're finding haulers mixing these things in, are you fine, do, are people getting fined? Are there repercussions?

Charlie Whittaker

No, no, no, nobody is getting fined. We don't punish people. So, this is volumes of trash coming in at once and being recovered. A lot of times, things are loaded, people say they don't know about it, they're just bringing it in. They're making some money. You know, um, dumping it in our place. In the automated trucks with the, with the trash cans. That's the time most people deal with it. You know, they're picking them up and dumping them in there. So, this is coming down on the packer. The packer does 11,000, I mean, 1,000 houses, and that's with automated trucks. The point is that, you know, our place is to capture it as much as possible. And that's what we're doing.

Legislator Maloney

Okay.

Charlie Whittaker

It would be easy, just to let it go. And believe me Joe, it would be easy to let it go and blame it on the surface, but we do not do that.

Legislator Maloney

All right, Charlie, with regards to the amount of solid waste that you have coming through that we're producing and accounting, can you give me the last 3-5 years. Can you give me the last three to five years, are we go, are we trending up, are we level, are we trending down? Up each year?

Charlie Whittaker

Waste is going up. There's been a lot of problems with burn plants, Joe. A lot of problems with other transfer stations and stuff, moving waste. There's a lot of jobs with people working, a lot of people don't want to work. So, we've been really, really hit hard.

Legislator Maloney

So, we're taking in? So, with other burn plants, that means we're taking in other county's solid waste that they can't get rid of, or what does that mean?

Charlie Whittaker

Yeah, you know, it's my guess, trash has to move. So, it's either, it's either gonna end up on the roads or across the Rhinecliff bridge, or it's gonna end up you know, over at our place when they're leaving. I can't tell you for sure, how much, or if any, might, do I think some out-of-county trash is coming in? I do think out-of-County trash is coming in. But do I, do we know exactly how much in a packer? So, if somebody picks up 100 houses on its, on the way over the bridge, and then come and pick up another 900 houses? Is it mixing a load? Yeah, it is.

Legislator Maloney

Let me ask you, let me ask you this. With, there's a lot of talk about. I mean, I've heard talk about a burn facility here. There's a lot of talk about spotting a landfill. I don't think those conversations can even happen when we're producing 15, 20, 25, 30% more solid waste each year. I think we have to be trending down before we have responsible conversation about spotting a landfill in Ulster County. Even if it's as great as Tracy says. I'm asking you, if money was no object, is there equipment, retrofitting some, some in-house things that we can do? What can we do to get off the trend line we're on, which we have, we have to get off of, but with your expertise in the RRA? What are some things you could do, if money was no object? So, there's no limitation to what you can say we can do? What can we do to get off this trendline so we can have, finally have, that responsible conversation about what to do with the solid waste?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

I'm gonna let, hold on Charlie, I'm gonna let you answer that. But Legislator Stewart has had his hand up for a while, so please answer Legislator Maloney's question, and then we'll recognize Legislator Stewart, because we have a long agenda.

Charlie Whittaker

Joe, Joe, Joe, as long as we live in a world where things are no good anymore, you can't. Look you know, 30% of E-waste can be refurbished. That's it. The other 70 percent, 70, it gets broken up into the metals and the plastic, and goes to markets. You know if you want to, if you want to cut back on waste, rehab capitalism. But you can't rehab capitalism because then you would have to have only so many people working in factories and producing only so much stuff. The retail business would only be allowed to sell so much stuff, and since we tax paychecks and we tax items that are being pulled.

Legislator Maloney

Charlie, that's, that's not, I'm not, that I can't, there has to be a way. I mean the tipping fee alone, you can, you know, I'm not here to debate you, but your answer cannot be we're just going to produce more and more solid waste. There are things we can do to deter it. There are things, there are things people can do. Compost, renewable, reusable, how do we get people to do that?

Charlie Whittaker

Joe, we are there. Joe, Joe, we did 5000 tons of food waste the year before that. What other county is doing that? We are the only county that's doing that, Joe. We are doing that. But we're not.

Legislator Maloney

Well if there's no answer, the only answer I see is the tipping fee. It has to be talked about Charlie.

Charlie Whittaker

So, so, the tipping fee, Joe, you know, if you, if you raise the tipping fee, people are just, I know you don't want to hear this, people are just gonna throw it on the side of the road.

Legislator Maloney

I don't want to hear it.

Charlie Whittaker

Disposal, I know you don't want to hear it, but disposal has to be reasonable.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

It's not a matter of not hearing it. It's, it's a question of, I'm not sure everybody on the call realizes that there's a group that's been working for like a year and a half, maybe two years on waste diversion, it's a zero-waste implementation. It's an ad hoc committee. And there's a representative from the agency, from the Department of Environment, from the Legislature, and some volunteers. And, and so, we are working on that. I think that's the forum. And we can create other forums. But to just get into a debate right now, as Chair, I'm going to allow Eric Stewart, to, Legislator Stewart to ask a question. And I'm also going to request that Charlie Whittaker send the numbers to Fawn so that, if she wasn't, sometimes it was a little hard to hear, and we also have to have the meetings transcribed.

Charlie Whittaker

Yeah, I can do that. But Manna, Manna, let me just add one comment, right? I just want to say this, right? Sometimes the old ways are the best ways, right? Education, outreach, right, get into our youths, right? Having people understand the value, you know what I mean, of not spending more on more junk. I mean, most of the time, the average thing is about six months, and we throw it away. So, you know, we have to really start educating people and really get rid of this desire to spend. I mean, when you look at the cell phones joke, I mean, every time I buy a cell phone, and it's like six months later, it's not sorted. And you can't refurbish it. You have to fix those problems. So, outreach and education is the best way to go. I think that's where we have to head. I think that's, it's, again, everything is about maintaining.

Legislator Maloney

I'd love to retort, but I don't think I'm going to be allowed to.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Um, let's give, Legislator Stewart a chance, and then we'll let you say one more thing. And we'll move on to the next topic on the agenda.

Legislator Stewart

Great, thank you. Thank you so much. Manna, you kind of read my mind in that I was going to request from Mr. Whittaker, those, the figures that he just laid, just read out earlier about all the tonnage of the various different categories of waste. That would be very helpful. So, thank you for that. I also had another question. I was wondering how much of the increase of waste is directly related to COVID? I mean, I know that, you know, so much. So many more people have been ordering things from Amazon. So many, and Amazon is notorious for ridiculous amounts of packaging and stuff like that. And also, there's been a lot of excess garbage being thrown away. I mean, you know, I'm sure there's been tons of masks that have been tossed out. And so, I was just curious if you had any idea about how much of that was directly COVID-related, and therefore perhaps, we might not see as much, hopefully, in the future?

Charlie Whittaker

No, um, I don't know, I think if I had to answer that question, I had to give you a reasonable number, I think it would fall between 10 and 15%. I think if I had to, if, you know, that would be my best guess at that number, 10 to 15%. And again, I got a say to you, you know, a lot of, a lot of the cardboard boxes and stuff that come into our place we're capturing, there's a lot of stuff that there's no market for, like the bubble wrap and, and, and the coated plastic paper and stuff. There's no, there's no market for that stuff. You know, you, everything is, I say it over and over, right. Everything is grade dependent, market demand, right, supply and demand. That's, that's what it's all about.

Legislator Stewart

It used to be that China bought a lot of our waste. I mean, how do you?

Charlie Whittaker

You know, it's funny, right? So, it's funny, like when we talk about China, there was a time when nobody wanted us to go to China. And when they found that we were sending stuff overseas, they were really. I see Emily's here, and Manna remembers too, people used to be livid about us sending any of our cardboard stuff to China. You know, and then, all of a sudden when China shut, shut the doors on everything, everybody started to panic. You know, right now I can tell you that in a good number for me to tell you, so, about, I would say 50% of our cardboard is going to China or the Philippines. The rest is staying domestic. 100% of our plastic is staying domestic. You know, the glass is still being used as the beneficial use, so, we're not trucking that out of state. Um, what else? I think all my paper, 50, 50% of my papers stay in domestic. So, you know, that, that, that that's what's going on with the commodities. I, you know, I know a lot of, a lot of my metal is going to China. I'm sending it to local scrap yards, of course, but a lot of it's going to China. When the, when COVID first hit, all the scrap yards shut down. People were throwing cardboard out, scrap yards were shut down. It's like, we kept things moving, we kept baling, and we kept sending to markets, as difficult as it was. We actually, this agency, and I want to thank the board for support and everything that we've done, two folks at, at this meeting, Charlie Landi and Katherine were instrumental in making decisions for this agency to keep moving materials and keep shipping, recycling out. That's why we brought dump trailers and tractors and new loaders and stuff. We have in the back of our, we have in the back of our MRF, just on our composting alone, we have two loaders, we have two screeners, and we have a stacker. You're looking at over a million dollars' worth of equipment. So, the two folks sitting right here, you know, deserve a lot of credit for supporting this. Everything that we're doing to keep things moving. There used to be a time, we had to go to, we bought these dump trailers, we predicted a problem a year ahead of time, we purchased these dump trailers to move glass and to move metal, and Charlie, you remember this, right? And all of a sudden, it hit. And we had no place to take our metal and glass. We started using our, these dump trailers, we got them just before everything shut down. And we started moving our metal up to Albany to Sims. And I think they were loading that up and sending them out of the country. Actually, I know they were. And then we, everything started to open back up a little bit, and we started to stay local with our metal, but I still do send 50% of my cardboard, newspaper to China, and I send up 100% of my plastics, domestic. So, I want to say this, 90% of all plastics are staying domestic, just so you folks know. 100% of ours are, but just so you know, 90% of all plastics are staying domestic.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, um, I want to remind. Yes, Katherine, I see your hand, and take yourself off mute. As I remind you.

Legislator Petit

Legislator Erner has his hand up, too.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

All right. I believe that, you know, most of the year last year, we were getting written reports ahead of time. I don't think we did for this meeting. At least, I didn't see it. Fawn, can you let us know? Usually they go to Fawn, and she forwards it with the package. So that would save the time. We would have the material and we would be able to ask questions. But I recognize Legislator Erner, and then I want to ask for essentially a board report or report on what is currently going on at the agency. A lot of this is background information. It's the first meeting and it's understandable. But um, if you can give that some thought, I'll ask a Legislator Erner to make his comment or question. Please take it. Okay.

Legislator Erner

Okay, thank you, Chair Greene. Thank you, Mr. Whittaker for your report. Thank you, members of the Resource Recovery Agency for joining us tonight. As folks know, I'm new to the legislature, and I'm pretty new to following our RRA. I've been working to arrange a tour there. But meanwhile, one concern that came out as I was running for office last year, that RRA folks who were on the meeting that I attended the other day, and I had asked and did not get an answer. So, I'd like to ask it again here please, for any of you to give us an update about the situation with the Comptroller and her request for records and where that's at from your perspective. Thank you.

Katherine Beinkafner

Okay, I would be happy to do that. Um, right now, there's an appeal and everything legally is at a halt. Um, we don't believe that she has the right to audit the agency, because we are not really part of the county government, which is very hard for everyone to understand. But that just happens to be the way it is. We're an independent agency established by the State of New York Legislature, and so forth. So currently, it's all on hold. The other things I wanted to address while we only got a couple minutes is, Charlie was good, we, we really have had more solid waste this year than ever before. And it could be because of COVID. Who knows, but that's what's going on. But also, about 15 years ago, I was on the board, and then I was off for a long time. And that's when we conceived of this idea of trying to remove stuff from the floor, so it didn't go to the landfill, so that we're recycling it or it's getting another home or another user, it's going somewhere, like the batteries. And they've done a phenomenal job of doing that over the years, more and more stuff is being removed. But it's a very dangerous place because you've got all these big trucks backing and dumping it on the floor, you got the big excavator, lifting it up, dumping it over the wall into the big truck that's gonna take it to the landfill. So it's a really precarious situation, but it's a great job that they do, but they just got to be really careful. The other thing I wanted to mention, Tim DeGraff, couldn't come tonight. Um, we have an opening for a person who would be a recycling educator. Melinda France has been in that position, but she's been promoted to office manager. So, we're looking for someone to be recycling educator. And God knows we really need this person, along with Angelina Pione-Brandt, to work on getting the word out. Because, you know, the biggest problem is people don't know what can be recycled. People don't realize how much we generate, and how much has to go to the landfill. So this recycling educator person, if you know of anybody who would be interested or qualified, or someone who might know someone, by all means, call up the agency, or I'm not sure, the job description may be on our website. I'm not sure. But that's what it is.

Charlie Whittaker

It is.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Oh, good. Okay.

Katherine Beinkafner

So that's really all I had to say tonight was just to mention that, and you know, come and visit. We love for you to see what we really do. And the other thing is almost everything that we recycle, our product is clean. We do not have contamination. And that's the biggest problem, when you mix all the recycling together, it never gets sorted out perfectly. So, we actually can sell our products on the market, whereas a lot of other, I don't know who they are, but places where they do recycling, where they grind it all up into little pieces and try to separate it out, it doesn't get separated out clean, and that's a big problem. So even though we sort of are like, an old fashioned MRF, it works because we have people sorting it out. So that's all I have to say. Good to see everyone.

Charlie Whittaker

Katherine, I would just like, just, I would just like to add a few things also. First off, I want to say that when it comes to food waste, we just can't say, 'bring it all bring as much as you got,' and have a complete disregard for what our permit says. We have the only permitted place that I know of, not registered, but permitted for organics. We had a 2500-ton limit. Last year we did 33. The DEC was aware of that. I wasn't going to turn it away. We were violated for going over, but that's fine because we have a modification. Everybody's still working from home, so everything is extremely slow. We have a modification for 2500 tons more, 5000 tons, to accept at our facility. So we are still waiting for the approval of that modification. All the engineering has been done for that modification. So I just want to let everybody know. So there are rules that we have to play by, and we have to apply for certain things to take more waste in when it comes to stuff like this. So I just wanted to make sure we pointed that out to everybody.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Legislator Stewart and then Legislator Petit.

Legislator Stewart

This is just kind of a quick comment or a question. I understand that the main problem with recycling is getting things sorted properly and I've always, always wondered why perhaps we couldn't cite a, a sorting facility at a prison, and actually have prison guards, and have the inmates sort recyclables. It seems like you know, that way we wouldn't have to pay people to do that. But that was just kind of a quick random question I was going to pose. I mean, perhaps there's security reasons why that wouldn't work, but it seems to make sense to me.

Charlie Whittaker

Well, I also want to touch on something Kathy said about the single-stream. So I always say this, right? You can't unscramble an egg. So you can't take a bunch of dry fiber, you know, your moisture is, you know, 25%. Anything above 25% with cardboard moisture, it's going to get rejected. So, with everything dripping on it, glass breaking, all kinds of cardboard being, being damaged. You can't go back, I don't care what kind of facility you have, I don't care if you have a \$35 million facility, you can't go and mix. You can't go and take a good product, make it bad, and make it good again. I don't care how many robots you got, how many optical eyes you got, how many

blowers you got, you just can't do it. So, now they have what they call dirty MRFs. Right, so now you're not, it's not even about having one separate recycling can. Now there's no separate recycling can. There's places out there to get dirty MRFs, and you just mix them together and, and they sort, they sort it at their facility, and they have a high concentrate of course of, of dirty material. But then, these places also run waste to energy plants, so that works out really well. So they can, they can sell steam to make energy, you know, so I just want to point that out. My attention is on my phone for a second here. So now they have dirty MRF, single stream MRFs, you know, destroy the product. We have laws, I just want to say, I saw an article on, that says that, you know, we need to change the laws, that we said that. We have good laws, I'm going to be perfectly clear about that. We have really good laws, and it really touches on a lot of stuff. You know what I mean? As far as keeping the fibers all separate from each other? You know, I know Manna I mean, not yet, Manna and Emily, remember the days where we sorted everything, right? We sorted the tin from from the plastics, we sorted the cans from the plastic, we sorted the newspaper, we sorted the cardboard, the different color glasses, do you folks remember that? I mean, there was like, you had like eight different recycling containers on your porch. And then when we built our MRF, we, you know, we said, hey, you can mix the plastic to tin, the bottle cans. You know, and the glass, all different colored glasses all together. So we streamlined that, and then, but you still had to keep the the fibers separate. So I just want to make sure you folks know, we have good laws on the books. It's just, we have to go back to those laws and, and start seeing where we need to make them apply, so we can get better a better product out of what's being recyclable, and better accountability on who's recycling.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Legislator Petit? And then I have a question, and then we really want to go.

Legislator Petit

Legislator Maloney has his hand up too, I'll defer to him. Thank you.

Legislator Maloney

Well, I won't take long, it'll just be comments because we're not getting anywhere. I mean, we should almost do a subcommittee meeting, you know, term after term after term. We don't get off the solid waste production, you know, trend line that we're on. We never get to a real conversation about spotting a landfill. Charlie does a wonderful job, they work their asses off over there. Their day-to-day operations over there, nobody's working any harder. Nobody's doing anything more than they can do. I'm not saying that. But I'm saying, we need to do more. And we need to get more of these questions answered. Now we're talking about contamination. We don't know how much is being contaminated. We're being told everything's, everything's great. There's nothing more we can do. I hear education. Education is just informing people of how to produce less solid waste. So we can do more. And it's not, education is not going to get us there. If we did a ton of, even a ton more education, put more money into education, we might move the bar a percentage point. But if we need to get where we need to go, part of it's going to have to be the tipping fee. At some point, we're not going to have anywhere else to take this stuff. So believe me, everyone's going to be paying more for their garbage in 5 or 10 years, an insane amount, and we're not going to have any solutions at that point. But we could actually get to where we need to be a lot quicker by beating everybody there. How many, what's, what's not being recycled that has a number on it? I'd like to know, and I'd like to know why. What plastics aren't being recycled? What can we do about that? Is there some in-house? Is there some equipment we can get? We got to start having real conversations, and not what's happening here. This is what always happens, year after year. What just happened here. None of us got all that much better. None of us, we don't have a plan for the coming weeks or months. We have to get down to it. Really start

answering these questions, and start talking about all our different options, no matter how expensive, but I'm not going to sit here and go through this every single month. It's just, it's unproductive.

Charlie Whittaker

Joe, as I listened to, you know, as I listened to you Joe, back to the same thing. Packaging. You know, I mean, the biggest, the biggest culprit here is packaging.

Legislator Petit

Point of order. The chair has the floor.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Thank you. This is not the forum for this conversation. I think it's an important conversation.

But what I want to remind you is that there is a recycling oversight committee. There's a zero-waste planning group. There are a lot of people paying attention to this. And I think that what I'm hearing is, we need a forum to bring anyone, not just the legislators on this committee, but any legislator who's interested, up to speed, but the intention is to, for the RRA to manage what they do, as well as they are doing it. But there are a lot of materials that they can't manage, and so, there's \$75,000, for a feasibility study, for Reuse Innovation Center, where things like mattresses and other things that are difficult to manage, more C&D, that it doesn't just get pulled up, it actually gets recycled. And there is, that's all in the works. So, I think we need an opportunity, a remedial opportunity. And I'll see if we can set that up. So that these questions can be discussed, but we can't take the whole night, tonight. We haven't finished our reports or got to the resolutions. I have one last question for the RRA, and it has to do with, the idea is through the Zero-Waste implementation plan, we have a plan to divert as much waste as possible. And through the Reuse Innovation Center, we'll be able to, you know physically divert a lot more waste than can be diverted. And that will, especially if you take out the food waste, which our law is doing. And you take out things like sheet rock, which produce hydrogen sulfide, the rotten egg smell of landfills, if all that is removed, and there's a clear plan, including a timeline and finite finances, and who's responsible, then the landfill itself will, um, you know, be less onerous on any community. And then if you add to that, a fair host community benefit package, but I heard Legislator Maloney say that we shouldn't be working on citing a landfill until we are working on and actively diverting as much waste as possible. I agree with the second part of that statement. I mean, it's gonna take a while to cite a landfill. And once a landfill is cited, we get to keep the tipping fee. Some of that has to go to pay off the capital. It relieves us of the pollution burden, and the cost of shipping our waste. And I checked with Charlie Landi, I said is it really \$8 million a year? He said, he told me that last year it was \$9 million. So um, you know, let's find a way to have this conversation. But I don't think we can pursue it any further tonight. But is there any update on the landfill siting process that you would like to share with us? And I'll direct that to.

Charles Landi

Manna, can you hear me? Okay. Manna, yes. Hydro quest. I have to backup. Last October, we had a meeting. The RRA met with the New York Department of Environmental Conservation. And Kelly Totoro advised the agency to hire a consultant to see if there was any place in Ulster County's 1100 square miles that could accommodate a lantern. And we did, we hired HydroQuest, and HydroQuest just recently came back with the

report and the report we, the report is not public at this time, because we have to go back to Kelly Turturro. And for those of you who don't know who Kelly Turturro is, she's the Executive Director of New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, Region Three. So, whatever happens in the three counties that take up Region Three has to cross her desk. So now we have to bring the consultant's report back to her, and have her screen it, according to Article 360 of the DEC rules, and see if, in fact, the recommendation by the consultant firm, meets the requirements of the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation. But I have to, I would like to add, and hopefully answer some of Joe Maloney and Eric Steward's questions. Most recently, most recently, as of tonight, there was a late entry to the agenda. And I don't know if you caught it, but some of you, I'm sure most of you caught it, but it was that the RRA wins composting awards. And the US Composting Council recognizes the best of the best in the compost, manufacturing, and organics recycling industry. The RRA is the proud recipient of the 2021 Small Scale Composter of the Year award. That was the late entry in your agenda. I'm sure, Manna, you've seen that? Are you still there?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yes.

Charles Landi

Thank you and congratulations. Fawn, was that your hand, or were you, was it a thumbs up? Thumbs up.

Fawn Tantillo

I was applauding, Chairwoman. I just have one quick housekeeping thing. I didn't want to interrupt the conversation. But I see a caller from 9175333208. May I get your name?

Tanya Garment

Hi, Tanya Garment here.

Fawn Tantillo

Tanya, and what was your last name?

Tanya Garment

Garment, like clothing.

Fawn Tantillo

All right. Thank you.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

All right. Thank you all. Um, and with that, I would request a report on, from the Department of Environment. Nick, will you be giving that report an update?

Nick Hvozda

Thank you, yes, I will. I don't have any specific topics to, to discuss with the committee tonight. But I'm happy to give an overview of some of the projects that are on our work plan for this year. And I do have one announcement as well. I'll start with that. The, our department is sponsoring a, an Arbor Day tree planting program that's municipally focused, focused on municipal events that have had some sort of municipal, municipal sponsorship.

We're partnering with the Ulster County Soil and Water Conservation District to provide trees to the municipal groups who want to do plantings. And we're looking for a demonstrated public benefit in the planting event. So, there's an application that's been circulated. If you haven't seen it, I can share it with you. And the window for applications is open throughout the year, not just during the Arbor Day period. So, that's the first thing. A couple of the projects we have, we have four grant projects we're working on at the department now. One has been ongoing for two years now. It's a Climate Adaptation Plan, where we're evaluating assets and the county as a whole for climate change vulnerability, and doing a risk assessment on, on those assets. A part of that project is to develop a municipal toolkit that will allow municipalities to complete the same exercise using some mapping tools that we're developing in Arcgis.com. And we're working with a group of students from the Bard Center for Environmental Policy Master's program to help with that project. And that's a Climate Smart Communities grant from the DEC. We also have a grant to do a natural resources inventory that's county-wide from the Hudson River Estuary Program. That's, the procurement is happening currently, and we'll be contracting and starting that project within the next few months. We're also, we've received a grant from the Climate Smart Communities program to do a Community Climate Action Plan. It's scheduled to be, or it's planned to be about a 12 to 15-month project. We're weighting our revenue contract right now for the grants. And then we'll start procurement for that as well. That will have a large community stakeholder outreach portion that will be primarily led by a consultant that we hire, and certainly welcome input from, from this committee on the direction of that. And the fourth one is a small grant through the climate smart, Clean Energy Communities Program from NYSERDA to do a weatherization project on two of the buildings, two county buildings. This is an action grant we received in the program for completing a solarized campaign last year that met the standards of the Clean Energy Communities. We have three capital projects where we're involved with. I'll give a quick update on those and then stop for questions. Currently starting design for a lighting retrofit of the Social Services Building. Current, the building currently has several thousand T8 and T12 fluorescent bulbs, and we'll be converting those to an LED system and updating the design to make sure that it meets the current codes. We're also closing procurement on a rooftop solar design for, for the UCAT bus garage, that will supplement the electrification of transit that's happening there. And there's also doing planning, we're in the planning stage for expansion of the EV charging network around the county. Not just the public charging network that we post now, but a greater footprint for fleet focus chargers to support the growing Green Fleet. And the last one is planning stages for the Reuse Innovation Center feasibility study, which is also in the capital plan. I'll stop there and answer any questions.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Just to, can you just connect that to the previous conversation? If you could just, just say a word or two.

Nick Hvozda

For the reuse center?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yeah, please.

Nick Hvozda

So, there is a \$75,000 capital project that's planned in this year's capital plan to do a feasibility study for a Reuse Innovation Center from the Department of the Environment. We've, we've put forth a proposal about the, the timeline and the, some of the components that would be required for, for us to manage that project as a, as a capital project from the department doing the procurement, stakeholder engagement, and then ultimately

managing the contract with the consultant. That's, that's one way it could go. But I'm happy to share more about that proposal.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And that dovetails with the work that the Zero-Waste implementation planning group has been working on. It's one of the three major components. And the fact, I just really want to commend you and your department for immediately paying attention to that and not putting it on a back burner. And, and I want Legislator Maloney and others who have been asking about this to know that that is moving forward, and if we can stay on or close to the proposed timeline, that project could be actually implemented. We're doing a feasibility study this year. And it's a big question. So, it makes sense to do a feasibility study to answer all the questions and I'd love to help gather questions that you may have, but it could be implemented as soon as next year, which would mean that by the time a landfill is sited and constructed, we will be diverting the maximum waste that we can, and, and hopefully increasing every year, what we're diverting, and therefore, what goes to the landfill will be less and less. I just want to stress that, because it's a long time coming, and really commend department for not putting it on the back burner but in fact bringing it to the front burner and taking action. Any, any questions for the Department of Energy for Nick? All right, very good. The next is the resolutions. And I want to mention one thing. Maybe before we get into the resolutions, but there, I was sent a couple of environmental checklists that had been filled out, for some bridges and relevant projects that are not on the list for resolutions for tonight. But the way the law was constructed, or the policy was developed, that those who would come to the Chair of this committee to review, and if I thought that they needed to be discussed by the committee. And then, when it comes up in public works, it would have already been reviewed. So, if I understand that correctly, did I say that correctly, Fawn?

Fawn Tantillo

Yes.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay. So, and my suggestion is going to be, and with Deputy Rider here, I think these forms, could also, see if he can take a look at it. No, it's not going to work. These forms could also apply to the ARPA projects. And I'm going to make that suggestion to Legislator Chriswell. It's just a way of looking, you know, in some cases, it might be not applicable. But in other cases, at least, you know, that's a way to sort of ensure that we're taking a look.

Fawn Tantillo

I just shared. I just shared so you could look at it.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

You just happened to have that handy. Great. So, I just wanted the committee to know that that's a sort of one of our responsibilities, is to review the environmental considerations checklist. And, and I have a couple of projects that I think will then, if I understand it correctly, will be going to public works.

Deputy Executive Rider

Can I just?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yes, please.

Deputy Executive Rider

Just one thing on that, my only concern is, since this meeting, often times happens, well, every month, will happen after the Public Works Committee. If you, after you review these checklists, are you going to go to the committee, because we're not going to be able to fill out the checklists many times a month, prior to submitting a capital project to the Legislature, so.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

It's not necessary, the way the law was written, is just to send it to me, you know, the Chair of this committee for review, and then it will also be attached to the resolution that goes to public works, but it's not, you know, it's public information. And if committee members would like to see it, they're welcome to, but it's not going to be an agenda item, unless there's something really striking, you know, that we have to consider, but generally, that would not be the case. And I can even reach back to you if I see something and, you know, so that by the time our committee meets, I've already had a chance to touch base with you about it.

Um, so the next thing on the agenda is to start the resolutions. And Resolution No. 10 is confirming appointment to the Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency. It's a TBD, and I would like to revisit this after we go through the other resolutions, because we may need to go into executive session just to get clear. As long as we're just talking about the resolution, we can do that in open session, but if we're going to talk about specific ways to fill in the TBD, the blanks, we would have to go into Executive Session. And I don't want to hold all the other people on this call. So, I will revisit that.

But the next one is Resolution No. 15. Setting a public hearing on proposed local law number one of 2022, a local law amending the code of the County of Ulster Chapter 131. Vehicles, county, Article One, sustainable Green Fleet policy, in relation to strategic, to strategies and goals, to be held on Tuesday, March 15, at 2022 at 7pm. So that's something that we often do is, is set a public hearing, it doesn't mean that we're making a recommendation on the details of this. It is to set a public hearing. Do I hear a motion for discussion?

Legislator Gina Hansut

Motion.

Legislator Maloney

Second.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Thank you, that was Legislator Hansut followed by Legislator Maloney. Any questions or discussion on Resolution No. 15? Yes, Legislator Stewart?

Legislator Stewart

I'm sorry. So, this is just discussing whether we want to have a public forum, or are we actually going to talk about what's in the resolution?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Well, I won't limit the conversation, because it may be relevant to whether or not we want to set a public hearing, but the resolution is specifically to set a public hearing. Okay. Legislator Erner.

Legislator Erner

Thank you, Chair Greene. The, I was just, the materials concerning this seemed to suggest we were, had planned to have a hearing on January 4. I take it that didn't happen?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Um, I don't really recall the answer to that. I'm sorry. But for this resolution, it is setting a public hearing on March 15. And I apologize, I just don't remember the details. I don't know if anybody else on the call can answer that.

Deputy Executive Rider

I thought there was a resolution setting a public hearing last, the last session of the Legislature for January. So I thought that happened. And I thought the resolution that was going to be in front of the body this month was changing from 5% to 21%. So I'm not sure.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Does that coincide with your recollection?

Fawn Tantillo

I'm not sure.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Oh, okay. She's looking. And while she's looking. Eric, did you have a comment?

Legislator Stewart

I guess I was just curious as to why it was at 20%, and not 25%, or 30%. I was just wondering how we came up with that figure.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Legislator, the two legislators that are proposing this are not on the call, and perhaps I should have talked it over with them ahead of time. Legislator Maloney?

Legislator Maloney

Yeah, I think, Marc, you could tell, what are we at overall in the county right now? 11, 12%, depending?

Deputy Executive Rider

Yeah, I mean, I don't have the exact. Nick might have the exact numbers.

Legislator Maloney

I'm not sure if I'm correct, but I was told that new, besides the, that certain, certain departments, are purchased, are at 80% green. I mean, is this, it depends.

Deputy Executive Rider

That was the most recent purchase. So I said in a committee meeting that our most recent capital, it's 80%. But that's not where we are overall. The answer where we are overall?

Nick Hvozda

We're at about 9% currently.

Legislator Maloney

I think it's a fair conversation to be had in caucus. I don't know enough about it. But from what Mr. Stewart was just saying, why not 25 or 30. I think Laura had said something like that as well to me. I really, so, maybe the two. Who was sponsoring this?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Legislator Walter and Legislator Chriswell.

Legislator Maloney

And it was in conjunction with you, Marc, like this is, are they, is this just theirs? Or is this in, are they kind of carrying this for the Exec. Is the exec happy with that number?

Deputy Executive Rider

I think 20% was, I think, last time I talked to Nick 20%, you felt that 20% in the next three years was going to be fairly aggressive with DPW and the sheriff's office, but, you know, we would probably make other numbers work, it's just going to take a little bit more pushing, especially with some of the departments that don't have a lot of opportunity, like the Sheriffs and DPW who have the majority of our fleet.

Legislator Maloney

Could it be split up by department?

Deputy Executive Rider

Potentially?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Um, well, one thing I would like to suggest, since this is about setting a public hearing, and we're not actually voting on the law, that we put requests that the sponsors be at our next meeting. If people would like to receive a setting on public hearing, I'm not sure how time sensitive this is, you know, otherwise, we could fold it, or officially table it. But, and I take responsibility for not calling them and getting really clear on what their rationale was. But I really feel like I can't speak for them.

Legislator Maloney

I'll make a motion to postpone for a month.

Legislator Stewart

Second.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

All right, any discussion on the motion? All right, all in favor of the motion to postpone Resolution No. 15, and I will request that one of the sponsors come and speak to it when we take it back up in March. All in favor, please signify by saying aye.

Committee Members

Aye.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And anybody opposed?

Legislator Maloney

Chair, just a quick comment to the, I don't think anyone opposed. Perhaps if we're, I mean, it seems like this is something that may very well be what it ends up being, but if we're going to have legislators carry a resolution that is largely written by the Executive, then, then have somebody from the committee carry it. And then, you know, it's kind of on us if we're not educated enough to answer the questions.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yeah. All right. Well, let's, nobody said they were opposed to the motion to postpone. All right. The next is, this is a lot. So um, Resolution No. 18, appointing an administrative, an, an independent administrative Hearing Officer, pursuant to Paragraph 304-25 of the code of the County of Ulster. And this is another instance of to be determined. But I think the Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency has been asking for this, and there are other reasons, to have an administrative hearing officer. So we can move forward, I believe with a TBD, and then have the chair of Legislature fill that in, otherwise we could also, and just so the committee is clear, we can hold it without formally postponing or we can formally postpone. Any comment?

Legislator Maloney

Yeah. And then I'll pass it over to Laura. Quickly, you know, we talked about this on another meeting. The difference between postponing, I'm under the impression and correct me if I'm wrong, if we postpone it.

Fawn Tantillo

Excuse me. We haven't moved it?

Legislator Maloney

We have not moved it. We're still discussing.

Fawn Tantillo

Okay.

Legislator Maloney

Oh, well, let's move it for discussion right off the bat. Okay, I'll make a motion to, for discussion. Whoever, second?

Legislator Stewart

Second.

Legislator Maloney

All right, for clarity, if we, if we postpone, you can postpone something three times, it can be postponed kind of against the will of the, the person carrying it, and then it has to be voted on. If we don't act, it doesn't start a clock. That's kind of the difference, as I understand it. With this, I don't think it matters what we do, I think we'll be acting on this. This will be postponed or, or I'll probably make a motion to if, if Legislator Petit is okay with it. I think she got a call from the Chair as well. And I think there was, Deputy Executive Rider had pointed some things out that legally, we could write this differently. I wasn't told the specifics, but I, but I was told that within a month, we could have this, right? This is the way it's been done in the past, what we put forward. But apparently, there's some other compliance officers that we have in the county and I think Mr. Ryder, maybe you could explain that they wanted to, we wanted to formulate this resolution to have it look more like what we are, what we're doing in the county inside of a couple of other departments, even though it will still be in our, kind of acting on the RRA's behalf for violations and tickets regarding recycling. But Laura, I know you had your hand up. And then if Marc, if you want to explain anything, I'm willing to, I was just told about this a couple hours ago, but there's another way to go about this. So I'm willing to go about it a different way. I think we can do it quickly. Obviously, I think if Mr. Whittaker has anything to say too, I'd be interested to hear his thoughts.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Legislator Petit.

Legislator Petit

Thank you. Um, this resolution was passed back in 2008, or 09, when the Source Separation and Recycling law was updated, and we did, we had appointed Louis Klein then as a hearing officer. I don't think there were any cases heard by him, you know, whether it's just they didn't have any violations or, so, you know, essentially, we have this already in, in law on the books. And we could just very well put in another person. I mean, if you, I would like to hear the Deputy Executive's input on it. But I mean, this is already on the books as part of our county code. And we just need to find the right person. We've reached out to several attorneys. It takes somebody at least with a background in solid waste. And then the, the hearing officer would hear any complaints that went unresolved through the Resource Recovery Agency Compliance Officer, issuing some insistent complaints against individuals who are either violating the flow control or our source separation and recycling law.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And I think that's because the fining is not done by the compliance officer. The charges are brought by the compliance officer, and then the administrative hearing officer, if they determined that the charges were valid, would would set the fine or the penalty. Deputy Ryder, do want to speak to this?

Deputy Executive Rider

Sure, and my conversation with the chair was just around that we have, we have several administrative hearing officer contracts throughout the county with attorneys. And you all can appoint anybody you want. But I was just giving her the mechanics on, so I think there was a question on budget lines and how this person, whether they were an employee, would become an employee of the county. And we have panels of hearing officers for personnel issues. That here Section 75, which is like grievance, or disciplinary actions, our health department, the

environmental section, so if we have violations of the sanitary code, which is similar to this, we have administrative hearing officers that are attorneys, so I was just giving her the mechanism of a contract, which may be different than exactly this resolution. So I do think it's pretty quick, and probably be less than a month before you were able to figure it out.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

We'd like to hear. Go ahead. Legislator Stewart, please.

Legislator Stewart

I was just kind of following up. Actually, we were sort of on the same track, I guess. I was just wondering, I mean, is this a paid position? Is this like additional duties that are added on to someone who's already working with the county? I just wasn't quite sure how, how that worked.

Deputy Executive Rider

In our arrangements for the other panels, they're paid a set rate. I think it's typically like \$150 an hour, which is what you see a lot of times with attorney contracts, and, you know, we only pay them if we need them. So they're typically not to exceed, they charge us by the quarter of the hour, and it's normally \$150. And if the RRA needs them, then they're there. They're under contract.

Legislator Stewart

Great. Thank you. I was just curious how the compensation work, so thanks.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And if possible, it would be great. I see your hand, Legislator Erner, I'll call you in a second. It would be great if we could utilize somebody. I looked, and saw that there were, when, when Chairperson Beinkafner pointed this out several times, I saw that there were hearing officers and I thought, you know, maybe we could utilize, but I think the point is well taken that to, the, ideally the person should understand something about solid waste. It's somewhat specialized. So, Legislator Erner, please?

Legislator Erner

Thank you, Chair Greene. Again, as, as a newer person here, if just someone could comment briefly on the idea of having a separate role here, as opposed to using some other civil court that exists, or if anybody could speak to the origin of this, and the general idea behind having this, please.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Let me take a first crack at that. I believe that the administrative hearing officer was specified in, in the recycling law that, you know, that's how it would be handled. And as Legislator Petit said, we did fill this appointment in the past, and then somehow there wasn't a lot of compliance, originating either from the agency or anyone else, health department or anybody else that felt that the law was being violated. So it kind of fell to, fell away. And, and then the RRA has been asking, because they do have an active compliance officer, but there has to be a place for that, any charges to be heard.

Legislator Maloney

Chair, could we have Katherine explain to us kind of logistically how it would work, maybe that would help some of the legislators to understand. The RRA is asking for, for this position. So give us a hypothetical of how it would actually function real quick.

Katherine Beinkafner

Okay, um, the Flow Control law addresses solid waste, and not the recycling. And, theoretically, we have control of all the solid waste that is generated in our county. So suppose one of the haulers, we catch him hauling waste from our county across one of the bridges to say, Dutchess County. Then they're, they're not in compliance with the law. And that's, that's one of the instances, there's other instances, too. I mean, I'm not an expert in this law. The recycling, I didn't realize even that this would apply to recycling, so I couldn't give you an example of that. But I can tell you, in discussions recently, we're pretty upset that single-stream recycling just doesn't work. And we're going to ask to change that as soon as we possibly can, because it's just, it just generates so much contamination. But anyway, when I was on the board, like 15 years ago, we had this problem because we knew this was going on. And we just need this person. We have people, we have an enforcement person at the agency who could fine these people who are doing the wrong things, disobeying the law, and could give them a ticket, but we don't have anybody to be the hearing officer to see that there is a fine or some other result carried out.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

This is sponsored by Legislator Petit and Legislator Maloney, and it's very specific about the mandatory source separation and recycling law. Do either of you want to speak to this? And then we should.

Legislator Maloney

Laura, give a rundown on 30425, how it originated, and just give everybody a quick rundown on what we're trying to do. And then maybe, I don't know if we need to hear from Marc again, but basically, what happened was, there's another way to do this. It's pretty straightforward. This hearing officer for violations, that the RRA would have their compliance officer put out, and then there's just a different, what we're discussing right now is, Marc brought something up to the Chair. The Chair called me last second and said, there's another way to have this hearing officer. There's another way to structure it through a, the same way we do some other hearing officers in the county with a contract, and I said, 'okay.' This was like an hour ago. I said, 'Okay, I'll, I'll try to give everybody a quick explanation,' and then just basically, I was okay, waiting a month, I had no idea. I thought Tracy was going to give Laura a call after she got off the phone with me, and she didn't. So I was caught by surprise that Laura wasn't aware I was ready to postpone a month, but Laura, give everybody a quick explanation. You explain this better than anybody.

Legislator Petit

It was something that was actually missing in the original source separation and recycling law was, you know, we spoke about violations and, but there wasn't a mechanism in there to actually ticket someone and have a court process. And as you mentioned, in 304-25, it is clearly outlined, it's part of our county law now. And it has steps. I mean, as the, there's a compliance officer with the RRA, even though there's not flow control on recycling, it is a mandatory recycling. And the agency has been tasked with, with enforcing that, so to speak, you know, even if it's prohibiting people from dumping on their transfer station floor, if it's a mixed, you know, a mix load, everybody's getting really slow. Can you hear me okay? It looks like, Joe, you can hear me? Okay. So with that, you know, we established this position of administrative hearing officer. As far as I know, it was that that person was never utilized. It was Lou Klein. And it was brought up, I think, at our first meeting, post-COVID, in last

August, about the fact that we, that the agency was looking for someone in that position, as more specifically for violations of flow control. But you know, and I'm not sure what everybody's looking at, but I think we should clearly have this as an appointed position, even if it's contractual. I don't know if holding it up another month is going to make a difference.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

It makes a difference, because, if I may, I'm sorry to interrupt.

Legislator Petit

Yeah.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

It makes a difference, because I really don't like passing TBDs. I prefer that we know what we're doing, that we've looked at resumes, where it's appropriate, and so forth. So, would anyone like to make a motion to postpone so that we can work this out over the next month? It's been a while and, and I think that the folks from the agency are glad to see that we're addressing it. But what, to rush it through when we still have a few rough edges to smooth over and work out, I think that makes the most sense.

Charlie Whittaker

Manna, may I say something, please?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yes

Charlie Whittaker

I just want to say that the recycling, first of all, the mandatory recycling source separation law does mention an administrative law judge. It does mention Lou Klein, but we have not received any resolutions, nor do we have any resolutions saying that he was, he was going to be the, the the judge that we sent violators to. It was mentioned in the law that it was discussed with Lou Klein, you know, as far as Lou Klein being taken on that role, but Lou Klein was also taking on the role for the county at the time. In the law, that role with Lou Klein, he was not appointed for that for that role. We never had somebody to send violators to. Back in the landfill days when we hired Chuck Davis to go after violators and stuff, we were still seeking that position. Laura, back when you chaired in 2008, we have the minutes on that, where we talked about having this law judge, and, and it was supposed to move forward at that point, and it has not. So I just want to be perfectly clear.

Legislator Laura Petit

It did.

Charlie Whittaker

We haven't, we have nothing, Laura, no resolution saying who was. It's mentioned in the law, you know, but it's, but it's not mentioned that he, you know, it was mentioned that he was talked to about maybe possibly doing it.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

I think this is great. I understand that you're trying to make a clarification, but at this point.

Charlie Whittaker

Because we didn't, we never had a law judge that we could go to, I want to make that clear.

Legislator Maloney

I think what Charlie is saying is that that's the reason that, that, that they never, he heard it mentioned that there was never any violations or tickets. And I think Charlie's point is that under the RRAs, the way the RRA perceived it as they never actually had a job. That's what I think the point of what Charlie's saying is. I don't care.

Charlie Whittaker

No, it says there, written in the law, and I want to share it with you.

Legislator Maloney

No, no, no, I'm just trying to, I think everyone's trying to figure out what everyone else is saying. I was just saying, I think it sounds like you took offense to us, that somebody's saying.

Charlie Whittaker

I just don't want people to say 'Hey, you know, we gave them a law judge, and they never rectified it.' That's not true at all.

Legislator Maloney

Yeah. Okay, well, now we're trying to get one, and we're and at the last minute, we're thrown a curveball, we thought we had a tight resolution that opened up, and all we had to do was then choose a lawyer. But now they're, now we're finding out there's two different ways to do this. So I, I'll make the motion to postpone, but I'm going to get right on this tomorrow with Laura. And the next meeting we have, we'll have something. I'll contact everybody before the meeting, and make sure we're on the same page. But we, Charlie, we will be getting you this hearing officer. Thank you.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

I need a second.

Legislator Stewart

Second.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Second by Legislator Stewart, all in favor, please signify.

Committee Members

Aye.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, anybody opposed? The motion carries in resolution number.

Legislator Petit

Deputy Rider has his hand up, Chairwoman.

Deputy Executive Rider

Can I just speak on it one, one second? I mean, I think it doesn't really matter if this resolution just has a name added to it, that's fine. I think you just need to talk to an attorney. I think, some of the questions that the chair asked me, and she called me, I didn't reach out, and this wasn't today. Some of the questions the chair asked and raised was that there's not a budget for this, and some other things. So I think, you may need to, it, there may be another resolution that's needed to add money in the budget for it, that goes along with this, which is maybe why it makes sense to delay it a little bit. I don't know that the mechanism of this resolution really matters. You just put somebody's name in it and then do a contract later, you need the money for it.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

So that would be a budget amendment. So that'll come with it. And I'd like to move on. The next resolution is appointing and re-appointing members to the Recycling Oversight Committee. This is Resolution No. 19. And there are various positions listed that were included when the Recycling Oversight Committee was created by law. And um, let's see I believe that they, they are specified in Resolution No. 19, in the resolved, and that is that Town Supervisor Association would be Mike Baden, City of Kingston is Mayor Steve Noble, Energy and Environment Committee would be Joe Maloney, Ulster County Environmental Management Council would be Margot Becker, Commercial Waste Hauling would continue with Jonathan Kaplan from Royal Carting, Municipal Recycling Coordinator would be Aaron AnnaLynne from the town of Rochester, and commercial institutional sector would be Mike bombs from the town of Burley And the multifamily dwelling is TBD, the at large member is a Laura petite, who's been chairing, and another at large member is Donna Egan from Mako. So there's nice geographic diversity. And there's one more TBD. And I had said, I don't like TBD. But in this case, even if only the positions listed are filled, there will be a quorum and the recycling oversight committee has been reactivated. Was it a period of time where they hadn't been meeting, but they're very active now and are contributing to the zero waste implementation plan. So I'd like to entertain a motion on resolution number 19.

Legislator Erner

Motion to discuss.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Motions discuss. Yes, please. Do I hear a second? For a discussion? Who second? I didn't say

Legislator Eric Stewart

it's Eric.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Eric. Okay. And Gina, did you have your legislator hands it? Did you have your hand up to speak to it? Or just a second?

Legislator Gina Hansut

I was going to just second it. Okay. Okay.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Is there any discussion about this resolution? Yes. Legislator pretty high.

Legislator Petit

Okay. And I'm sorry, I keep saying my internet's in stable. It's just to clarify the Zero Waste implementation plan came out of the recycling oversight committee. And we've been waiting to get some feedback from the workgroup. What, what happened is, we were at the point where there were several materials that the workgroup was comfortable bringing forward. And those were presented to the recycling oversight committee in two separate occasions, one was kind of a, you know, a meet and greet presentation. And then we met again last month. This is a real good group of folks. And we're hoping to fill in those other couple of positions. I would like to ask, just as a point of clarification, I believe, legislator earner interest, but our clerks said it's difficult if they meet two of the criteria. So, if we already have someone appointed from this group, if he's still interested, would we under under, our law, for establishing the recycling oversight committee? Could we put him in one of the large positions?

Fawn Tantillo

I'm sorry, the way the law is written, the three at large positions can qualify under any of the other seats, and Mr. earner would qualify as a member of the Energy and Environment Committee, so you could not have to members of the committee on that.

Legislator Petit

Okay, that's all I got. I

Fawn Tantillo

would welcome him to attend.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, um, is the committee comfortable moving forward with the DVDs? And then I think as those decisions are, if there are people that step forward and are being considered, we can fill those out of attitude future with a future resolution? Yes, legislator. Oh, no.

Legislator Erner

Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Chair Greene. And thank you, Legislator Petite for the invitation. And for the clarification, that we can't do that, Miss Tantillo I think I'd be happy to play a spectating role in any case, just legislator petite or any, anybody else who could just illuminate me again, as a newcomer, I did read the law establishing these positions. And I'm just and I went on the last meeting, where I heard from a number of these a number of the folks who are being considered for reappointment. Mayor noble I didn't have too much to say in that meeting. I'm not familiar with Jonathan Kaplan. Or Donnie Egan. If you could tell us a little about Don And then also what this multifamily dwelling interest means. And that's where Yeah, please.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Let's see, do you want to answer? Do you want me to take a crack? All right, um, I want to jump in because I helped write this law when I was at the era, if memory serves me, and the purpose was to be sure that there was a vehicle before things were added, or taken off the mandatory recycling list, that all the sectors were represented. And that's what we, at that time, these were the sectors that seemed most important to have a voice and make their point and share their perspective. And so multifamily dwelling, a solid waste management and recycling is very

different than either the commercial sector or the residential sector or, you know, the haulers. So that was the intent, and that's why multifamily dwelling is listed. And it seems that whoever was either didn't want to get reappointed, or is not being listed, whoever was on that position. And then we have one more at large member, but you can see the the various sectors, and you know, even though there are other municipalities participating that for, and there's a municipal Recycling Coordinator, and you asked specifically about Aaron, and Irwin, and there was one other position

Fawn Tantillo

in Donnie, it used to be the run the recycling program in Sullivan County, I believe, and now she she was just appointed, she was interviewed in and Michael balms. They were both appointed, I believe in interviewed in August appointed in September. I don't believe they got to attend a meeting before their terms expired. So that's why they felt to put them back in I certainly can send you their resumes. The supervisors Association makes their recommendation the mayor is his recommendation. You know, the it's difficult to get a commercial waste hauler. Laura can confirm that Jonathan was very active, Aaron, there's only a couple of recycling coordinators in the county right now, many of the recycling programs, if I'm not mistaken, are run by highway superintendents. So Laura, would you were? I think there's only like three, when you were there, and I'm not sure what the title if there's still somebody in New Paltz with that title. So the multifamily dwelling, if my understanding was to try to get somebody who, ideally was doing maintenance in an apartment somewhere so they could talk about like the educational issues of getting apart, you know, multifamily dwellings to recycle. There's there's certain issues that they have just as commercial and institutional sectors would have that are different than household sectors. So Laura can correct me if I'm wrong there. But all of these people that are being reappointed have been fairly active on this committee.

Legislator Petit

Right, yes, yeah. They have our commercial hauler. I mean, I think he's only missed one meeting. And that was recently and he's willing to to come back on we, we have, you know, Michael Bohm, and Don Egan, who is our clerk just said, they were appointed and then we hadn't had any, any real meetings until recently. They're also very good and very engaged. So if we could just get that that multifamily dwelling person which would be you know, I'm assuming it could be somebody who's even in real estate, who manages leases and apartments, or somebody with a large,

Rebecca Martin

complex

Legislator Erner

but it be a tenant who has that responsibility to whether or not they're necessarily a super the building

Legislator Petit

I don't see why not if it's a multifamily dwelling, because it's a different kind of beast, right? You know, you're talking about working with multiple people, you need a different type of, of education and posting. And I mean, it could even be, you know, somebody from a large hospitality at Woodland pond. I know, I've given some presentations there. Because there's always questions or, or somebody from birches. I mean, if that's okay, that would open up the, the pool of potential members by quite a bit.

Legislator Erner

And did I hear that the mayor of Kingston appointed himself to this?

Fawn Tantillo

Is his seat to fill he can appoint whoever he wants, but he's, he's been very active himself.

Legislator Petit

He is, I mean, he's, he's been in environmental education for 20 years at a grant writer. I mean, the only other two options would be the mayor of Socrates or Ellenville. Um, I think it was,

Fawn Tantillo

and see, this is specifically a city of Kingston seat.

Legislator Petit

Okay. All right. Well,

Fawn Tantillo

there you go. There has to be someone a representative of the City of Kingston.

Legislator Petit

Because as it was originally written, it was confusing before, because there really wasn't an association of Mayors. And I think that's that's how it ended up getting changed. Legislator Stewart has this handout.

Legislator Stewart

I move that we vote on the resolution

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

is essentially calling the question. Thank you. And so knowing that the DVDs will be filled at a future time, I'd like to ask if people are in support of resolution number 19. As with the appointments as listed on favor? Is that a hand or your vote aye. Aye. Anybody opposed? Thank

Fawn Tantillo

you, Mr. Erna, you're no,

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

no, I said that too quickly. Okay. So I saw everyone's hand go up. And I have to still ask if anyone opposed and hearing no opposition. Resolution number 19. carries. And is that still a hand to speak? Legislator Stewart? No. Okay.

Legislator Stewart

No, I'm sorry. I'm having to use this weird little microphone thing. My apologies.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

It's working. So that's all we care.

Legislator Stewart

I'm having all sorts of technical drama tonight. So sorry for that.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And my apologies to the people who have been waiting patiently. And last but not least, well, actually, we have a couple. But I'm delighted to offer resolution number 23, confirming the appointment of Nick blaster, as the Director of the Department of Environment. Can I hear a motion? Motion? Thank you, legislator handset Second. Second legislator earner. Oh, oh, no. Okay, I saw him go like that. So but you're right. It does have to be said. Um, any discussion on resolution number 23. Okay, with that I will ask. Everyone in favor to please indicate by saying aye. Aye. Aye. Anyone opposed? Okay. Motion carries. And one more? Actually, this is this is an old resolution, if I'm not mistaken. It was already passed and just in the packet for information that is requiring the environmental checklist. Am I correct about that? Fine.

Fawn Tantillo

We're just resolutions of draft resolutions you had under discussion and we hadn't taken them off the agenda yet. So Right.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Typically, we finished the resolutions before doing any new business or old business But I'm going to ask that we do that because I think we might end up having to go into Executive Session on the the RA appointments. So, I would like to recognize at her request for Rebecca Martin to for new business regarding the potential pilot for the Champlain Hudson power Express.

Rebecca Martin

Thanks, Manoj. I'm joined tonight by Shannon Harris, who's also here. But I'll just start to frame the issue for the legislators here present. And I want to thank you, man for having us and the energy, energy environment and sustainability committee for allowing me to participate this evening. My name is Rebecca Martin, and tonight, I'm the Director of the Community Partnership Program at River Keeper wherever keepers mission is to protect and restore the Hudson River, from source to sea and safeguards drinking water supplies, through advocacy rooted in community partnerships, science and the law. And I'm here tonight to raise an important issue for the legislature. And that Riverkeeper has been following and that we would like to the well we would like the Ulster County Legislature to be aware of, and that that's a 30 year pilot request by transmission developers Inc, TDI, a Blackstone company and the Champlain Hudson power Express, or chippy there, the TD eyes that develop developer and the project that is poised in part to use the Hudson River as a conduit to bring energy from Canada's Canada's hydro Hydro Quebec to New York City. On the Chippie project, is one of two projects that were selected. There were seven, six of which were New York State renewable energy producing projects, with the exception of Chippie in September of 2021. To receive what what is known as tier four renewable energy credits their state subsidies, they're worth billions of dollars to be paid by utility customers across New York state. At the same time, TDI is seeking hundreds of millions of dollars more in local tax breaks in the form of 30 year pilots in 13 of the 15 counties along the route, where their transmission line would be buried, either underground or underwater. So in Ulster County, the route is entirely jet plowed underwater in the Hudson River, and where the river is being used, as I said as a conduit to deliver power to New York City from Canada. The chippy developer met with the Ulster County iba last fall, and according to their application, their property taxes over 30 years

would be \$94 million. If the Ulster County IDA were to approve the pilot requests by chippy their payment reduction would be 29 would would equal \$29 million over the life of the pilot or a savings of \$65 million. With no benefits for Ulster County. In Ulster County, that chippy cable would run a total of 18 and a half miles underwater in the Hudson. Using a jet planning process. As I mentioned earlier, Ulster and Dutchess County officials have expressed concern about stirring up known and unknown contaminants from the riverbed. During the process. The chippy developer said the construction contractors would only be in the mid Hudson segment of the river and Ulster County for one to two months, and then we'd never see them again, adding that the electric cable would be completely invisible in Ulster County. When asked how many jobs the project would create just the very foundation of any pilot requests. The developer couldn't commit to a number. So concerns about the pilot had been raised by the Hudson seven, which is a coalition of seven municipalities that draw drinking water from the Hudson River at Poughkeepsie, Hyde Park, Rhinebeck and then Ulster County as sophus Lloyd they're five public water supplies serve 106,000 residents, three hospitals, three colleges and major regional employers providing safe water for human consumption, firefighting industry and more. So what I'd like to do tonight along with our message from Riverkeeper is to share and I'll do that in the chat. The Hudson seven submitted a letter last December I believe, yeah, December the third to the Ulster County IDA. Um, and so I wanted to share that for your, for your to read. And to also know that for most of the communities in the Hudson seven, the Hudson River is their primary drinking water source. Well, for all of them, it's their primary drinking water source. And at least on the Dutchess County side, it's their only drinking water source. So tonight, I'm in well in relation to Ulster County, and it's late so thank you. I'm glad to be here tonight with Sharon Harris. Shannon Harris is a leader in the town of a Scopus. And along with the town of Lloyd, the two municipalities are located in Ulster County. And she Shannon is a founding member of the Hudson seven. And she's here with me tonight to provide some context for the Hudson said sevens letter. So Shannon, are you still here?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

I am. Thank you for the introduction. Rebecca, I just first I want to thank the county for supporting the Hudson sevens mission in the form of partial funding for a coordinator that is, has been eaten. And I just want to take a quick moment because I know it is late and we all want to get home or we're home. But we want to get on to better things. I want to speak to the extraordinary effort that the Hudson seven municipalities have been taken to prepare for the deepwater trenching that is on the horizon to occur. And just a few short years, the Hudson seven has been working diligently over the past year to bring the transmission developers to the table to just talk to us about what can be expected to take place and the potential impacts when they attempt to make an 18 and a half run of deep jet plow trenching, within a couple 100 feet of our drinking water intake valves. And for sophus. It's within 500 feet of our drinking water intake valve, which is the source water, the fresh drinking water for 1000s of us Opus residents, this activity is on such a massive scale. It's never been done before, not in our lifetimes. And not I don't think in the history of the Hudson River in this way. We know that this Canadian corporation admitted us that they never even took into consideration the impact of the project on our drinking water supplies. So and just so that you know that you probably a lot of you know that this mid Hudson area of the Hudson River is the source. It's the reservoir, it's the source water estuary for 106,000 people and businesses in the area. So, um, you we have been for a year now, trying to work with them, and understanding what they're going to do, how it's going to impact and preparing our municipalities. These folks aren't even equipped with the right insurance to handle if one of our water supplies gets knocked out by their jet plow, or taken offline by the extreme turbidity or dredging up of contaminants or damage that it could occur. So our municipal workers are aware of this and we brought them in for several meetings. Our water treatment operators will be on standby for months before and even years, where they're working now to prepare the testing that we insisted upon our lawyers and through

meetings that they did not want to do any pre testing of the dredging. So the bottom line is that there's a lot of unknowns here. We have dragged them to the table at every step of the way. They have reluctantly agreed to do the testing. And to ask the county the residents And the users of the water and to have some kind of tax break is really extraordinary. And I'm asking for your committee to consider to take a stand on this issue by saying no to the prospects of awarding a pilot in lieu of the only possible positive aspect of this project is the tax revenue that it will bring to the residents of Ulster County. There is just no nexus between the purpose of reducing this Canadian corporations tax obligation through a pilot, which is for the long term sustainable economic benefit and local job creation. And this short term, extraordinarily risky, environmentally damaging, and potentially hazardous dredging project that is for the benefit of New York City. So that that is what we're asking. I'm speaking on behalf of the Hudson seven and imploring you to consider our point of view, there are multiple other points of views, the environment, recreational aspects of the Hudson people's livelihoods that are at risk, but the drinking water is our mission here tonight. So thank you. All right. This is really meant as new business. We don't have any resolution memorialized, and we don't have a letter, that it was background information that was requested. It does affect Ulster County municipalities. And I just want to point out that the legislature has no direct jurisdiction over a decision that the IB Ida makes. We do actually approve their appointments, if I'm not mistaken, but but there, there could be a sense of Yes, please. Chairman, mine captain, Chairwoman, bank captain.

Katherine Beinkafner

Um, I just wanted to make a few comments about this matter, because I thought a lot about it. Most people probably do not know that my profession is a hydrogeologist. And I've worked on all kinds of water situations specifically for the town of Lloyd and various other places in the area. Um, I think this is the worst concept you could ever have. Because of the contamination in that water. You know, we don't know where the PCBs are, that were never cleaned up that leaked out of General Electric stuff well north of Albany. Um, as far as I'm concerned, the best place for it would be on land, either on a right of way, like the Peconic or the thruway, but definitely not in the water. I mean, this is the livelihood of these towns, and the risks, that contamination is absolutely horrible. Let me remind you how we managed to keep out fracking in this state. I remember going to all kinds of towns and town boards and people in talking about fracking, how bad it is because the the fluids they pump into the ground. It's like getting rid of hazardous waste. And here we are a very similar situation. We've got to get people energized to speak up. The more people who know about this, the more we can stop it, but that's what it's really going to take. So that's all I have to say. Thank you,

Rebecca Martin

Katherine. If I may just say that the reason why we're here tonight, too, is because we do understand that the legislature doesn't have direct purview over the IDA Hudson seven's letter was sent to the Ulster County IDA and also the Department of the Environment, but we thought it was really important that the Ulster County Legislature was made aware not only of this project, but of the amount of property tax or pilot subsidies that they were looking looking for from the county and not just this county, but 13 others and so here we are in Ulster County and the Hudson sevens doing a great job in raising awareness of this issue. And so that's why we're here tonight. Thanks, Catherine.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay, I think we've, I could ask about questions and I see Bear two hands. But as as you ask your questions, I'm gonna want to know if anyone wants to follow up to work on this. Because there's nothing for us, no action for us to take tonight unless somebody proposes an action. All right, I saw two hands, where do they go?

Legislator Maloney

Well, real quick, we'll be doing interviews for the IDA. And we can certainly ask them about this. And I think we've done a terrible job interviewing for the IGA term after term after term. And I think we need to start asking these, these individuals that are looking to be on the IGA about specific pilots of the past pilots coming down, you know, that are going to be asked for soon and, and having these individuals explained to us at the understand the law, that they have an idea of what they're doing, instead of, you know, I think, outside, you know, outside influence, basically telling them how to vote. And so, in the next couple of weeks, and I'll definitely ask and get some responses from some of these prospective Ida members before I ever agreed to vote for

Rebecca Martin

Thanks, Joe. One thing I will say is we did watch the movie, the movie the, the, the meeting, where TDI was present and transcribed it, and the, the Ulster County IDA was very skeptical. So that is good that they they, you know, there are other counties north of us that were convinced that this was free money without really, you know, examining what the request was and what the project was, and understanding what sort of concerns there might be with with the police or the fire or how it impacts school districts, and school budgets. So I was happy to see that in this case, the Ulster County IDA members were skeptical. So that was positive. In this case,

Legislator Maloney

they always are.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Any, any other comments? Ah, yes. When we're just later on. We are.

Legislator Erner

I'll yield to legislator Stewart first, please.

Legislator Stewart

Well, I was just going to ask a question. I mean, what would be an appropriate next step for us to take and opposing this? Or I suggested, I mean, I'm just I, since I knew this as well, I just don't even know like, you know,

Legislator Maloney

I don't know if we have jurisdiction to act on it in any way to we could ask legal counsel about that. But a memorializing resolution to bring some more attention to the fact that if the majority of the legislature was against this, sometimes hold some weight, especially with local environmental concerns, it definitely gets more people aware in the community that don't even know that this is coming down the line, nothing moves, the wheels of justice, like public outcry, sometimes a memorializing resolution can do that. I don't think we have jurisdiction to actually pass some kind of law that that disallows this kind of technology or construction, but a memorializing resolution was probably something.

Legislator Stewart

Thank you for that explanation.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

So, go ahead.

Legislator Erner

Thank you Chair Greene.

Fawn Tantillo

Oh, you muted yourself again, Phil.

Legislator Erner

Thank you. Ms. Tantillo, Thank you Chair Greene. I I would like to be the one to follow up. And as you'd asked Chair Greene, and I just like to make a few comments. First of all, thank you to the members of Riverkeeper Hudson seven for coming and speaking with us tonight. And this is this is an issue that if you weren't here I would have been bringing up. Anyhow, I've been following this for a decade, having come from the Capitol district before here where there are a group of folks who've been concerned about this for that that period of time. It seems like we have a a state shoving this project down our throat or at least not giving us any power to say no as legislator Maloney said overall, but and it does hurt me that our Ida has called it into question, but look at what we're looking at here. We're looking at a massive hydroelectric dam hundreds of miles north here in a different country. That's not renewable, I'm sorry. That's an old way of thinking about generating power. And that's not what we need to be accepting here in Ulster County, and certainly not giving them any money. Now, I'm in a prior career I also worked in in physics and environmental physics. So I'm happy to contribute that expertise into our understanding of the situation that we're facing. And to to share bank Hefner's point I want to amplify and go beyond that, like we kept we banned fracking in New York. But look, we didn't ban we didn't ban the piping in a fracking guess from other states and provinces. And we didn't ban the construction and use of fracking power plants in our state. So you know, the consistency with our state's climate leadership community Protection Act and the new state constitutional amendment, providing every person a right to clean air, water and a healthful environment is calling, bringing contradictions to the surface as far as I'm concerned. So I could go on a lot more about this, but I'll just leave it there. And I'm really looking forward to following up on this issue, thank you.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Okay. Is that a him was was restored?

Legislator Stewart

Yeah, that was a thumbs up. So.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Um, alright, so thank you very much. And, um, is there any other new business

Rebecca Martin

Thanks for having us, Manna. And, and thank you for hosting us and certainly Riverkeeper, and I think I can speak for the Hudson seven, right, Shannon, to say that we're happy to help the legislature in any way that they need, with materials and what have you to be successful here. So, thank you. And thank you, Phil. Appreciate that.

Legislator Stewart

And thank you ladies. It's always nice to see you both.

Rebecca Martin

So great to see you, too.

Thanks, everyone.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Um, I see Emily Hauser is still here. Emily, is there any update from me? I think I inadvertently skipped over that from Environmental Management Council. Hello,

Emilie Hauser

My name? Yes. I'm Emily Hauser, and I'm, I'm here as vice chair representing the EMC. And as Manna, I've stated at the beginning of this meeting, the EMC is part of your mission. And we were not on the agenda. So, I wasn't even prepared to report on anything. I believe that you get our minutes. And you can read our minutes. And I want to also note, say that Eric Stewart used to be on our, on the EMC. And I would say two things. One, for those of you that want to know a little bit more about solid waste, in particular, plastics, two to think is going to be at the EMC meeting. And as the speaker, so those meetings are zoom meetings, and the Department of the Environment helps us with the zooms. So, I'm not exactly sure who gets notified of the zooms. But Judah thanks is, you know, a former EPA administrator, and she now is really working on beyond plastics. So, and the EMC always has a speaker at the beginning of our meetings. And Judith has offered to speak so you might want to listen to that.

Legislator Stewart

And she's a frequent guest on NPR, too.

Emilie Hauser

Yes, she is. Yes. But she's, she's as a guest on NPR, but not necessarily about plastics. And she is also working very diligently with all the other environmental groups on a bill for the EPA extended producer responsibility, which can be one, one important solution for reducing waste, packaging and other waste. And so, Oh, so we meet at 6:30 on the last the last Wednesday of the month and not the fourth, the last so it can be the fourth it can be the fifth. So, the next one is the 23rd. And I would just say I don't have a report, but I will say that the people that are on the EMC are generally also on their conservation Advisory Council. They are doing amazing work. Every one of them, they are working on their natural resources, inventories, their open space plants are looking at Community Preservation acts, they are doing climate work, putting in, you know, helping their towns to get in vehicle charging stations. And so individually and, and all these towns, they're doing amazing work. We are very infrequently asked by the legislator to do any research or, or anything, but we sometimes do send resolutions to the legislature. For instance, you know, we could do something like the pilot, the pilot, one for the Hudson, for the chippy. Anyway. So, thank you for the time.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Absolutely. And I want to say that, um, Emily Hauser and I both worked at the CRA. I was there for a decade and Emily, pretty close to that. And we are now part of that zero waste implementation planning group. And Emily also chairs, materials management, for the mid-Hudson Regional Sustainability coalition where a lot of this

information is exchanged. With nonprofits, municipalities, businesses, you know, many of the sectors and all of the geography of the mid-Hudson region is representative on that coalition.

Emilie Hauser

So, and I would also say that just at the very beginning of this meeting, of the people that were on, that were represent, you know, Laura, Manna Jo and I have all worked for UCRRA, plus the board members. And there is, and then along with Charlie Landi, and everyone else that works at UCRRA, there is a huge amount of institutional memory, a huge amount.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

I don't think you'd find in another county in New York state that has so many people in government and government related committees that sort of cut their teeth in their local resource recovery agency. And if we can all work together, I really do believe we can become a model for the rest of the region.

And speaking of which, we have one other resolution to consider. And it has a TBA, it has two TBAs. And it's a resolution regarding the Ulster County. It's resolution number 10, which I've misplaced, but it's regarding the appointments to the board of the agency. I think Fawn kindly tried to schedule an opportunity to interview for the past few years, even though this is a chairs appointment like and then it has to be voted on by the legislature. The interview process has been held by Energy and Environment. And I think we've tried to be very fair and you know not and open to, to what is going to be best for the agency and, and best for Ulster County.

The reason I held this off is if people had things they wanted to discuss that required us going into executive session and we want to hold other people up. On the other hand. If it's if people are you know, we don't need to postpone this resolution. We can just hold it until after we've had a chance to interview Ken dates. So, I want to just open that up for discussion. But know that if you're going to be speaking, please do not speak. I think you all have resumes. But please do not speak about a specific person. We need to go into Executive Session. Essentially, it's a personnel issue.

Fawn Tantillo

I don't think you have resumes right now. Oh, but I can tell you is you're aware that Chair put out a press release the deadline to for people to apply - that is on the fourth. Right now, we have, we have four applicants, I'm aware of. Lisa Mitten, whose seat is opening up, asked not to be reappointed. She would like to focus on mental health programs and things and put her energies there. But we have right now we have four applicants as of Monday afternoon. I can send you the resumes or information we have on, on whoever has applied by then.

And we had tentatively tried to set up interviews, which would be a special meeting of this committee, on the ninth at, we're trying to start it in the afternoon, if we only have four applicants, we would probably start around 3:30. If we get more, we'll push it up to start a little earlier. But we'd set up 20-minute interviews, and then the committee could which were done an executive session. And then the committee could make you have a discussion, make your recommendations and go forward. I just wanted you all if we're going to try to get this done before the 15th so you can add names to this resolution. We don't have a lot of time to hold meetings, to do these interviews. So, I just wanted to see if your committee would be available on Wednesday, the ninth, starting around three or 3:30.

Legislator Maloney

I'd be available. I would say that. I'm not big on executive session, but I think the few people that would be booted off would probably be okay with it. At this point. I will give Nick some credit, he is stoic. And is not everyone else is showing real signs of fading here. But I feel even better about our appointment. He's shown some real toughness there. This is getting late. It Phil just asked that it's the fourth is that tomorrow, we had to kind of pick a date to kind of get these names in there because we're getting up against it. But if a name came in at the last minute, it was after whatever our deadline was, we could still accept that person in interviewing. So it's not hard and fast.

Fawn Tantillo

But the deadline is the seventh if I say, I'm sorry, if I said before the deadline for is the seventh at noon is what was in the press release for RRA seats. I know Gina is a teacher so 3:30 may be hard for her.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yeah. Oh, okay. Um,

Legislator Maloney

How long are we given ourselves per interview?

Fawn Tantillo

20 minutes?

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Well, usually it's 15. And then we sort of debrief a little bit for five, and then we do another interview. And then we don't have time for a lot of discussion. But at the end, then we take, you know, about another 20 minutes to sort it out and try to see if there's consensus,

Legislator Maloney

If we narrowed it down. What's that? I'm sorry, I don't know.

Legislator Gina Hansut

What time would you start?

Fawn Tantillo

We were talking about 3:30. If we only have four candidates. And, and if you would be available, like me to maybe have to break these up over a couple of days. We could do some on the 10th. Also,

Legislator Gina Hansut

I could I could see if I could leave a little early. So I could be there at you know, like 315

Legislator Stewart

I wouldn't be available.

Legislator Maloney

I'll make anything work.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And what day of the week is that? Just

Fawn Tantillo

Wednesday the ninth. So we will notice a special meeting for Wednesday the ninth. And we'll we'll see if we can start at around 315 330 and see if we can get the interviews in.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

For I don't need to do anything formal. I don't need to ask the committee to just hold it. We can just hold it.

Fawn Tantillo

You can take no action tonight. And we will make sure that's an agenda item on the night so you can vote on it that night. Great.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

And I want to thank not only thing, Nick, but also deputy Ryder, for hanging in there, really appreciate it. And I think you know, one of the last things I'd like to say, and I'll be sure that everyone else has had a chance. I really do believe that because of the extent and the rapidity of the global climate crisis, that we really have to find ways of working together. And one of the examples that I thought was really superb, was the little subcommittees to work on the our projects, where you had legislators and staff working together. And I went to one or two meetings, and it was so productive, because we were very solution oriented. And I think that sort of historically, even though it is absolutely the operations is absolutely the job of the executive branch. But I think sometimes when things were decided there and brought to the legislature, and we asked questions, it could seem offensive or critical. But if there's an opportunity on special projects, like, like ARPA, to have people working together, and as a matter of fact, it was from the legislature, they were bipartisan, one from from each caucus, and then the appropriate staff, I just think that's a really good way to get things done. And I also think that if we can get the new CRA, we already have the executive branch and and the legislature working together on the big picture for solid waste, that'll drill down into, you know, very concrete recommendations, timelines, funding sources, etc. You know, I think we can become a model to make a difference. And we've done that, in many ways over the years. And I do appreciate the report from the era and all they're doing, and Katherine just, you know, help remind them to get get get it in writing, so we can include it in our meetings. And Gina, you have not taken up a lot of airtime. And I always when I end a meeting, I tried to think, who hasn't spoken up. And sometimes the people who haven't spoken up have the best things to say, like I'm just not you no step forward. So just want to invite you to give me some closing thoughts.

Legislator Gina Hansut

Well, I've listened to those that have served before me. And they said to initially just learn and listen and take it in. So that's what I've been doing. So I have a lot to learn. I've taken a lot of notes. And I'm looking forward to working with all of you and moving forward.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Right, um, anything else that I've either overlooked or any other final comments. And by the way, it took me three years of being on the legislature to even feel like I belonged here, let alone knew what was going on. So, um, you know, it really is an adjustment. And you're going through that because this is a committee of all new people. So and Laura and I are here to help. And Joe Joe's been around this block. He's returning all right. I see a hand raised legislator earner I will entertain a motion to adjourn.

Legislator Erner

Pardon me, I just saw at the very end of our agenda, we had some old business and stuff. Does that just get pushed to the next meeting then? I

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

don't think there is any but I should ask.

Fawn Tantillo

She talked about the those draft resolutions. We're just going to those have been replaced by that climate checklist. And she didn't really get a chance to give us the climate smart update we normally do but

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

um what what I would rather And I absolutely will bring back information from the climate smart Committee, which I also chair and that it's not a standing committee, but it is a committee created by law. In fact, legislator petite, wrote that law. And its way there, there are five committee members, and we need a legislator from public works on capital projects, because I don't serve on that committee anymore. So I'm taking the seat of E. E. S. M, but the purpose is to advise the county directly on actions they can take that are climate solutions, or that are mitigating emissions, or, for example, with regenerative agriculture, helping to draw down and sequester emissions, et cetera. And, and we do keep track of that. And a lot of times those reports are coming through public works and capital projects. But it's also a networking opportunity for the climate smart committee representatives from all of the municipalities in the county, they haven't all taken the pledge, but by far, most of them have, and pretty regularly send representatives and, and share what they're doing, which will then give other municipalities an opportunity to say, hey, that's great idea, lets us do it. Um, and I'll try to bring some actual highlights. But what I do want to share is that myself and Penny Coleman from town of Rosendale, have been working with Scenic Hudson, on a solar mapping project that empowers municipalities, to look at their lands and see what are good opportunities for solar or other renewables or storage. And and then what are the constraints to doing so. And I know that marble Town Center, our Newman and City of Kingston has a representative. And there were 12 municipalities. And several of us are actually taking the next step of of writing a report, some of which will be speculative until we meet with central Hudson, but I think we have six recommendations, including the town landfill. And so it changes the municipality from a passive response responder to a developer's ID ideas, not that that's bad, but it gives them a tool to evaluate whether or not this is going to be a good site rather than just sort of trying to figure it out, or often referring to their engineer. But they become proactive in developing their own sites and encouraging the businesses. So for example, in Rosendale, we presented to the environmental commission, and now we're going to be presenting to economic development because it definitely is economic development, and the town board and planning barn, etc. And that training session is an hour and a half to two hours. And there are five sessions and we're doing it again in the spring. So if any of your municipalities would like to participate, we started out with 15 municipalities 12 of them completed, and the evaluations were really excellent. They were

deeply enrolled, and it's really made a difference so that the municipalities can take a leading role in achieving the goals of the state climate act. So I just want to put that out there and ask you each to think about

Fawn Tantillo

manage, oh, I just have to give you a plug, though, all of the, that's just one small piece that they're working on in the climate smart that man is working on, that climate smart committee gets so big. And so many municipalities were trying to do that climate smart pledge that Nick and Europa and Amanda, the folks at our Department of Environment, have formed a municipal climate smart task board that helps them with the nuts and bolts of doing that climate pledge. And Marc, the executive office was, should be very proud Ulster County was I don't know, if you're aware was in National Geographic for, I think the first county ever to be recognized for those climate actions. And so, they're trying to green the Ulster County Fair, they've got a group working on, you know, municipal lighting and, and lots of different avenues. So, if any of your municipalities, I went to a meeting in the town of Lloyd, and, you know, they were talking about municipal lighting, and we got them involved with Europa. You know, it's there's a lot of moving parts to this. And Nick is a great resource. And, and just, there's just, it all grew out of this Climate Smart Committee. So, which

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

grew out of legislator parties. It was

Fawn Tantillo

a farming committee, and,

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Yeah, Global warming committee, and then it became quite smart. And I'm willing to say that we were able to take our recycling rate when Laura and Emily and I worked for the era, from a documented 4% to a documented 40%. But that also included composting and some other forms of waste diversion was the same structure of bringing the municipal recycling coordinators together on a monthly basis, sharing information. If one person went to a conference, then they could bring that information back and, and all 20 of us didn't need to go in the end could benefit. So thank you for for the commendation. But you know, the working together is really the best way to to get things done. I have a hard time sleeping these days when I think about how rapidly the polls are melting and how much we need to do. But thank goodness New York has a very strong climate law that has been upheld. So far. The challenges to it have been upheld. And in many ways the governor is supporting it with her budget. And in the way she's not so here. Anyway. Did I hear

Legislator Maloney

a motion to Yes, I think we just became a full time legislature. Like five minutes ago. I'll make a motion to close.

Legislator Stewart

I second.

Chairwoman Manna Jo Greene

Thank you. For when did you get who spoke in both cases? Okay. Super. Well, all in favor? Aye. Aye, and nobody's opposed to adjourn and thank you all have Have a good evening and I look forward to working with each of you.

Legislator Stewart

Thanks, everyone. Good night, everybody. You all