

Commission on Reapportionment Meeting Minutes

DATE & TIME: December 21, 2022 – 5:15 PM
LOCATION: Legislative Chambers, 6th Floor, County Office Building, 244 Fair Street, Kingston, NY
PRESIDING OFFICER: Commissioner Regis Obijiski, Chair
LEGISLATIVE STAFF: Fawn Tantillo
PRESENT: Commissioners Sarah DeStefano, Andy Monk, Kenneth Panza and Travis Rask and Kathleen Waithe (on Zoom)
ABSENT: Commissioner Donna Lutz
QUORUM PRESENT: Yes

OTHER ATTENDEES: Robert Liebowitz, Department of Planning; Tom Kruglinski, Gardiner; Carol Nolan, New Paltz; Jeff Collins, Woodstock; Supervisor Mike Baden, Town of Rochester; Lanny Walter, Saugerties; Laura Hartman, Town of Ulster; Patricia Doxsey, Kingston Freeman Reporter and Roger Gilson, Times Union Reporter.

Chair Obijiski called the meeting to order at approximately 5:20 and asked the clerk to call the roll.

Public Comment

Ms. Hartman shared a grid she created (attached) showing the number of legislative districts in each town for the maps that were discussed on December 20th as a point of information.

Chair Obijiski shared information from Attorney Michael Cook regarding questions that were directed to the court. The first was in regard to granting possible exceptions to the open meeting laws to allow Commissioners to attend remotely from non-public locations such as the gate of an airport or while traveling in a car. This request was denied. The second question was in regard to allowing the Commission to potentially offer two draft maps for the public hearing on December 27th. The judge said they could if they chose to.

Chair Obijiski then restated the meeting schedule that included the Public Hearing on December 27th, the hearing remaining open for 24 hours after that for written public comment on December 28th, a meeting of the Commission on December 29th to review public comment and if necessary another meeting on December 30th. He was hopeful the Commissioners could finalize a map on December 29th. The last deliverable was the submission of a final map to the Board of Election on or before January 3.

The Commissioners discussed pros and cons of several maps and narrowed the selection to 4. Then each commissioner ranked their top two choices from those 4.

The Commissioners discussed presenting one or two maps at the Public Hearing on December 27. They reached a consensus that this might be confusing to the public and agreed to present just one map.

Commissioner Monk expressed his frustration that at the mapping discussion the last time because it was his understanding that they could always make some modification for the final map after the public hearing. However, some modifications were dismissed by his fellow commissioners because the public did not have an opportunity to comment on them. He clarified that parts of other maps and/or suggestions for modifications to

this map would still be considered as options even if they were not part of the map presented at the public hearing.

Motion No. 1: To present the map titled Travrask1 created by Commissioner Rask for the Public Hearing on December 27th and only present one map.
Motion Made by: Commissioner Monk
Motion Seconded by: Commissioner Panza
Voting in Favor: Commissioners DeStefano, Monk, Obijiski, Panza, Rask and Waithe
Voting Against: None
Votes in Favor: 6
Votes Against: 0
Disposition: Motion Approved

Commissioners discussed some housekeeping items such as attendance at upcoming meetings, updates to the website and preparation of map for public distribution for Public Hearing comments.

Public Comment:

Ms. Hartman asked if the meeting was recorded and was told all of the meetings are recorded.

Several members of the public thanked the commissioners.

Chair Obijiski asked if there was any other business, hearing none he called for a motion to adjourn.

Motion Made By: Commissioner Rask
Motion Seconded By: Commissioner Monk
No. of Votes in Favor: 6
No. of Votes Against: 0
Time: 6:07 PM

Respectfully submitted by: Fawn Tantillo
Minutes Approved: December 29, 2022

Comparison of Plans

Municipality	Population	Minimum LDs*	Petitioner Map	Baden Map	Regis 12 20 22 Map	Regis BOE Map	Travis Map	Ken Map 1	Ken Map 2
City of Kingston	24,198	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Denning	493	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Esopus	9,565	2	3	2	2	2	3	2	2
Gardiner	5,615	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2
Hardenburgh	221	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Hurley	6,186	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Lloyd	11,151	2	2	3	3	3	2	3	4
Marbletown	5,659	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Marlborough	8,723	2	2	2	3	3	2	3	3
New Paltz	14,418	2	2	3	2	2	2	2	3
Olive	4,232	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Plattekill	10,441	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	2
Rochester	7,284	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Rosendale	5,785	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	2
Saugerties	19,064	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
Shandaken	2,871	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Shawangunk	12,524	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
Town of Kingston	936	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Ulster	12,690	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
Wawarsing	11,397	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
Woodstock	6,290	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1
Total		34	40	42	41	41	41	42	45

*Minimum number of Legislative Districts required, based on mean population of 7,815.

Highlighted cells show towns divided into more districts than in other maps.

Name	User	Map Name
Petitioner Map	Lwongpan	12 2022 Proposal - LAURA WONG PAN 12 2022 Proposal
Baden Map	Mikebaden	5 Rule Variations - 5 rule variation
Regis 12 20 22 Map	Regisobi	Regis 12 20 22 Rev - Regis 12 20 22 rev
Regis BOE Map	Regisobi	Rob 6 23 Boe Edits Kenp - Regis 12 20 22
Travis Map	Travrask1	Modified K 1 Map - Modified K 1 map TR
Ken Map 1	Kpanza	Cor Map 1 Corrected - COR Map 1 Corrected
Ken Map 2	Kpanza	Cor Map 2 Corrected - COR Map 2 Corrected